



# The Phenomenon of Private tutoring in BiH

February 2011

Education Policy Center

## The Phenomenon of Private tutoring – Possible Solutions *The case of Bosnia and Herzegovina*

Brief report on research

Andrea Soldo, Steve Powell

proMENTE social research

### Private tutoring in BiH as a parallel system of education?

Bosnia and Herzegovina has a developed market of private tutoring which is not defined in any way.

Private tutoring is an understandable market-oriented reaction to a difficult position that the system of education is currently in. Aside from positive effects of private tutoring which provides a source of additional knowledge, private tutoring in BiH is also accompanied by a series of serious, adverse consequences, such as instigation of corruption, strengthening of gray economy and reduction of quality of formal education.

This report underlines the widespread existence of the phenomenon of private tutoring which can no longer be ignored. Some recommendations as to how to define this area have been made, which we see as a first step toward concrete activities in fighting against negative consequences of private tutoring.

proMENTE Education Policy Center is part of the international Network of Education Policy Centers – NEPC, which has 23 members in 20 countries in Europe and Asia. One of the activities of the Center is to provide an expert approach to research in the field of education in order to promote education policies.



## The Phenomenon of Private tutoring – Possible Solutions

### **Brief report on research**

Research conducted by:

Andrea Soldo

[andrea@promente.net](mailto:andrea@promente.net)

Steve Powell

[steve@promente.net](mailto:steve@promente.net)

## Introduction

“The phenomenon of private tutoring - possible solutions” is a research conducted in 2009/2010, the findings of which are presented in this report.

Private tutoring (PT) is defined as additional teaching in school subjects, which is delivered outside regular classes for a charge, and relates to the subjects that students learn about in school. Private tutoring is separate from extra-curricular activities or additional free-of-charge teaching regardless of who provides it.

The introduction of private tutoring is entirely perceived as positive since this form of education helps students to acquire and upgrade their knowledge, it allows a different approach to teaching, it represents investment in human resources, it has a valuable social function because it facilitates interaction between peers, and it represents an additional source of income for teachers. On the other hand, it also produces negative consequences which may not be so obvious at first. Private tutoring should have been an “addition to a rigid formal education system which accepts changes less readily” (Silova et al., 2006); instead, it has become a disconcerting phenomenon which warrants action.

In order to make it happen, all stakeholders should participate and act together.

The data and the recommendations below can be used by legislative bodies, ministries of education, school administrations and all those participating in development of the education system and policy-making in the field of private tutoring.

They can also help raise public awareness of the phenomenon of private tutoring and can be used as a means for advocacy in the efforts to make the education system as fair as possible for all students.

## How did we begin?

High quality public education is key for development of an open, democratic society, for preservation of social cohesion in any country and for improvement of the quality of life of its citizens.

The countries undergoing transformation from the socialist to the democratic and market-oriented system have been working on the reforms of their education systems since early 1990s, with an aim to create efficient and high quality educational settings for all children.

However, the transformation to the market-oriented system likewise produced certain unforeseen consequences, of which some could jeopardize equal access to quality education and undermine open society, social cohesion and quality of life (Budiene, V., 2007).

For an increasing number of students and their parents, the participation in the process of teaching and learning in the official education system is not sufficient to fulfill personal desires or minimum requirements imposed on them by the system.

As a result, a substantial number of students and their parents decides to use the services of additional teaching outside the official system. At the beginning of the 21<sup>st</sup> century, the phenomenon of private lessons (private tutoring) was proclaimed a “worldwide mega trend” in education (Baker and LeTendre, 2005.).

Worldwide empirical studies show that no education system is free from private lessons, which are often metaphorically called “education in shadow” (Bray, 1999.). The metaphor of private lessons being the shadow of the education system is in particular appropriate since:

- There are no private lessons without an official education system just like there is no shadow without an object,
- Forms and characteristics of private lessons change with the changing of the forms and the characteristics of the education system

- The attention of the education policies and research is mostly focused on the official system, not on its shadow
- The contours and characteristics of the shadow are less distinct than those of the official system and the shadow is therefore more difficult to study and analyze
- Private lessons are not a passive factor which merely reflects the events in the system; they also have a rebound effect, changing the system, sometimes even jeopardizing it.

The prevalence of the phenomenon in high schools in some European countries (Bray, 2011)

- ✓ Finland – less than 5%
- ✓ UK – 10%
- ✓ Germany – 15%
- ✓ Austria – 20%
- ✓ Portugal – 55%
- ✓ Slovakia – 56%
- ✓ Lithuania – 62%
- ✓ Greece – 80%

Education systems in different countries vary significantly in the frequency and the characteristics of the phenomenon, which directly depend on the quality of the education system and the degree of inclusion of children in education.

In the European Union, the phenomenon is picking up the pace, representing a new challenge for education policies which they have yet to face (Bray, 2011.).

A drastic increase in the number of private lessons in Bosnia and Herzegovina and in other countries in transition is controversial as it may indicate that the public education systems do not meet the needs of the students, which puts the children who cannot afford expensive private lessons in an unfavorable position – both with respect to acquiring knowledge and skills and enrolling in a limited number of higher education institutions – and that this process can additionally affect social stratification in transitional countries (Budiene, V., 2007).

In spite of a long history of private tutoring in Bosnia and Herzegovina (BiH) dating back to the time of socialist Yugoslavia, there were very few data available as to the extent, the forms and the function of private tutoring.

## Monitoring of private lessons – findings of the first research

“*The Real Price of Education – Monitoring of Private Tutoring*” is part of the international comparative research conducted in 2004/2005 to look into general characteristics (scope, types, intensity, school subjects and price) of private lessons in secondary school education.

In addition to Bosnia and Herzegovina, the research was conducted in eight more countries – Azerbaijan, Georgia, Croatia, Lithuania, Mongolia, Poland, Slovakia and Ukraine.

The research was based on quantitative and qualitative data, including the research encompassing 1,700 students of the first year of the University in Sarajevo, as well as a focus group study and interviews with students, teachers, tutors and representatives of educational institutions.

The findings for Bosnia and Herzegovina have indicated that 32% of respondents use private tutoring services in the final year of secondary school whereas 54% stated to have colleagues in their class who use private tutoring services. Students mostly use services of private tutoring in one school subject; 66% take private lessons in math, 10% in foreign languages and 9% in physics. Private lessons are taken once or twice a week, usually throughout the school year, and occasionally during summer breaks. The primary function of private lessons is to prepare for knowledge tests.

During the research, the students were paying an average of 270 KM per year for private tutoring services.

Based on a rough estimate, around 2.7 million KM was spent on private lessons in the Federation of BiH in the school year of 2003/2004. This is the low-end estimate, taking into account only the students of senior years of secondary schools and excluding younger students of secondary school, students of elementary schools and university students (Husremović, Dž., Trbić, Dž., 2007).

According to the findings, private lessons are more used by women, students coming from smaller towns, students attending very attractive university programs (business, construction and civil engineering, medicine...) and children of highly educated, working mothers.

## Where are we now?

The research “The Real Price of Education - Monitoring of Private Lessons” provided an insight into how students perceive the phenomenon of private tutoring; however, contextualized information has not been provided on possible solutions to the problems caused by private tutoring and there was no scratching the surface of the quantitative data gathered in the research. It was therefore necessary to look into the views of all those involved in the development of the education system and to identify possible solutions to the problems caused by private tutoring, having in mind various educational, economic and cultural elements.

“*The phenomenon of private tutoring*” is part of the international comparative research conducted together with the Network of Education Policy Centers (NEPC), and supported by the Education Support Program Institute.

Private tutoring (PT) is defined as additional teaching in school subjects which is delivered outside regular classes for a charge, and relates to the subjects that students learn about in school.

The findings of the 2004/05 research indicate that:

- ✓ 32% of respondents use private tutoring services (PT)
- ✓ 54% say to have colleagues who use PT services.

Beneficiaries:

- ✓ mostly use PT services in one school subject
- ✓ 66% in math
- ✓ 10% in foreign languages
- ✓ 9% in physics

The research has been conducted in six countries, members of NEPC - BiH, Croatia, Estonia, Azerbaijan, Georgia and Mongolia.

## Methodology

In order to go further than the quantitative data gathered in the 2005 research "Monitoring of private lessons", a qualitative method was applied on the research "The phenomenon of private tutoring – possible solutions" to be able to answer the questions "how?" and "why?", and identify recommendations for possible solutions.

A suitable sample of participants has been identified in the research, consisting of representatives and creators of the education system – representatives of educational institutions at different levels (entity and cantonal ministries of education, institutes of pedagogy, agencies), representatives of teachers associations, representatives of parents associations, representatives of political parties, and representatives of organizations/institutions which provide services of private tutoring<sup>1</sup>.

The techniques used in the research for data collection were individual semi-structural interviews and focus groups. The totals of 27 interviews and four focus groups have been conducted.

The first phase of the research began with a round of interviews to find out how the creators of the education system perceive the very phenomenon of private tutoring, what they know and what their views on the issue of this phenomenon are, what they consider to be primary causes of using the services of private tutoring, what the consequences are, and whether certain reactions are needed.

---

<sup>1</sup> The list of institutions/organizations whose representatives participated in the research is provided in the Annex.

Based on the analyzed data of the first phase of the research, the second round of interviews was initiated with an aim to identify recommendations for possible solutions to problems caused by private tutoring.

In the final phase of the research, a set of recommendations was designed to define the phenomenon of private tutoring in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

## Findings

### On the phenomenon of private tutoring in Bosnia and Herzegovina

Private tutoring (PT) is defined as additional teaching in school subjects which is delivered outside regular classes for a charge, and relates to the subjects that students learn about in school. In the context of BiH, private tutoring mostly relates to private lessons organized by individuals of various professional profiles who in a private arrangement define a program and mode of work, as well as the price of the services offered, where the revenues are not controlled, reported or indeed taxed. Private tutoring is not considered a new phenomenon introduced by socio-economic changes of the 90's; however, the market of supply and demand is far more significant compared to the period 20 years ago.

A general observation of the representatives of the education system is that the phenomenon of private tutoring is quite widespread. With regard to the future trend, some think that it will increase while others think that the use of private tutoring will decrease for several reasons: poor material status of parents/students, reform of education and newly passed laws in the area of education, as well as the laws being prepared for the improvement of formal education.

It is estimated that around 2.7 million KM was spent for PT in the FBiH in the school year of 2003/04

General observations of the representatives of the education system are the following:

- ✓ The phenomenon of private tutoring is quite widespread
- ✓ Individual classes are a more common form of PT than preparatory classes
- ✓ PT's function is to catch up on missed lectures, very rarely to upgrade and build knowledge
- ✓ PT is present at all levels of education, but it is least present at the higher education level

According to the participants in the research, individual lessons are a more common form of private tutoring than preparatory courses or classes. In both cases, the function of the private tutoring is to catch up on missed lectures; motivation is usually preparation for a higher level of education (secondary school, university) and/or improving grades. Private tutoring rarely has the function of upgrading and building one's knowledge.

With regard to the level of education where private tutoring is most present, the participants agree that private tutoring is very much present at all levels of education, but it is least present in the higher education. The beneficiaries are becoming younger and younger, starting to use the services of private tutoring already in the fifth grade of elementary school with the introduction of subject teaching.

Students of various profiles use the services of private tutoring; these are, in most cases, students who can afford it – children of parents with average or high income, children of parents who do not have necessary capacities to help their children (time, knowledge, authority), and children of those parents who think that formal education cannot adequately respond to educational needs of their children.

Service providers are usually teachers, students and professionals in a certain field (e.g. mechanical or electrical engineers). The participants in the research see the possibility to generate additional income as the main reason for providing services of private tutoring.

The identified causes of private tutoring are primarily of educational nature, followed by social and economic reasons.

Insufficiently trained and educated teachers, as well as problems relating to inadequate curriculum, textbooks and lack of standards, are topping the hierarchy of causes, followed by dissatisfaction of teachers with their financial and social status, change of social values and the so called poor parenting.

Most participants in the research view private tutoring as a whole as a positive phenomenon which in the context of BiH has negative consequences; it should exist as an option; however, its negative effects need to be addressed and reduced. Majority of respondents agrees that private tutoring represents an important issue; however, it does not have priority over other issues of the education system in BiH; all respondents share the opinion that the reactions are necessary and those private tutoring needs to be placed within a certain frame.

Parents accept private tutoring as part of formal education and think that private tutoring should be regulated in such a way to make it accessible to everyone. Service providers are of the opinion that certain progress will be made if conditions are created to establish specialized organizations or associations for provision of services of private tutoring while the representatives of the institutes of pedagogy and teachers think that the formal education system should be reformed and changed, which will result in decreased use of private tutoring.

According to the participants in the research, taking any kind of measure requires inclusion and joint actions of all stakeholders.

- ✓ The beneficiaries are getting younger and younger and are starting to use PT services with introduction of subject teaching
- ✓ Beneficiaries are usually children of parents with average or high income, those who think that the formal education system cannot adequately respond to educational needs of their children

PT services are usually provided by teachers, students and professionals in a certain scientific field, with the main motivation being additional income

## Causes and consequences of private tutoring

Having analyzed the collected data, we have identified the findings and categorized them into several main topics for better understanding, as described below.

### *Present, accessible and popular?*

Private tutoring is present at all levels of education. It has even been observed that the beneficiaries come from junior grades of elementary school. Although school subjects such as math and foreign languages are still the subjects in which private tutoring services are usually used, it is not rare and unusual for students to take private lessons in other school subjects as well, such as mother tongue, geography and history.

The market of private tutoring is so developed that it can respond to almost all demands of its beneficiaries; there are plenty of service providers and the price range is wide, making the services of private tutoring more or less accessible to everybody. Income generated through private tutoring is not taxed, the control of market is non-existent, and the quality of services is questionable.

*Representative of the Institute of Pedagogy: This is such a widespread phenomenon that it is impossible to control it.*

*Representative of the Ministry of Education: Even though the Ministry of Education has no official data, I think that private tutoring is quite present, even more than it seems, and there has definitely been an increase in use of private tutoring in the last ten years.*

*Provider of private tutoring services: There are no more rules for that. Lessons are provided now to the increasingly younger population; some use private tutoring services as early as the first grade of elementary school.*

*Representative of the Ministry of Education: It is interesting that there are almost no subject in which the lessons are not given, even in the subjects which are, so to speak, less important. I think that all other subjects in some way and in some segment have private trainers except physical education.*

In some circles, private tutoring becomes a status symbol, an expression of prestige.

*Representative of the teachers' trade union: Private tutoring is just another way for some people to show that they have more than others.*

*Representative of a political party, in charge of education: For a certain category of people financially quite better off than others, private tutoring represents a matter of prestige; it represents a measure of how much a parent cares for his child, which could be interpreted that those who invest more money in private, additional teaching, care more about their children; they are unfortunately of that opinion. Also, it is an expression of their status.*

Some kind of trend is present – to have a private tutor in almost all school subjects shows that a parent can and wants to invest in his child by hiring an “additional pair of hands”.

The perception of private tutoring has altered; something that has been perceived as a sporadic and more or less undesirable activity to be hidden from others, slowly becomes an established practice of students of elementary and secondary schools which is greeted with approval, since it represents a way of acquiring education which the formal system does not provide to everybody in the same way.

Children of an increasingly early age are beginning to use the services of private tutoring; the services are used even for those subjects which are not considered “demanding” and “problematic”, which is indicative of the fact that private lessons do not represent only an aid for overcoming problems which are characteristic of “difficult” school subjects (math, physics, foreign languages), as most people think; private tutoring is slowly becoming a parallel system of education.



### **Is the formal system of education to be blamed for everything?**

According to the participants in the research, the inadequate system of formal education with all of its shortcomings – insufficient compatibility of educational levels and cycles, insufficiently trained and educated teachers, problems with curricula and school textbooks, and non-existence of standards for evaluation – to a great extent leads to widespread private tutoring. The teachers themselves are also partly to

*Representative of the Institute of Pedagogy:  
Our education system is full of shortcomings and that is the main reason; private tutoring only mirrors the current situation.*

*Representative of the Ministry of Education:  
The education system as such is not bad; we have the problem with school staff who do not know how to teach.*

*Representative of the Ministry of Education:  
Teaching staff in our schools vary from great and creative people to completely wrong people who destroy class after class.*

blame; the quality of formal education of future teachers is questionable, the selection criteria for teaching colleges are low, future teachers do not receive enough practical classes and experience prior to obtaining employment, and the teachers already working are not motivated enough, which is in the end reflected in the quality of teaching and work in the classroom.

Private lessons are usually taken in the period of final exams (mid-term, end of school year) and before taking entrance exams for higher levels of education (secondary school, university), which reveals incompatibility and incoherence both between school subjects and between different levels of education. The services of private tutoring are almost always used to catch up on missed lectures, not to upgrade one's knowledge.

The organization of classes also represents a problem because teachers do not have either the space or the time to devote to students individually.

Not all students come with the same foreknowledge. They cannot rectify weakness in their knowledge in any other way but through private tutoring.

Even though the existing forms of instructive lessons (additional classes) in formal education are free of charge, they do not adequately respond to educational needs of students. They are not given regularly, the curricula and the mode of work do not differ from regular classes, and teachers lack motivation to give additional lessons, even though they are part of the scope of their work, since their work is not adequately valued to begin with.

Additional income is in fact the most common reason why teachers decide to provide services of private tutoring. This sometimes places them in an unenviable position of “corrupted teachers”, who give private lessons to the same students they teach in regular classes.

*Parent: The main reason for using private tutoring is too extensive curriculum and incompetent teachers.*

*Teacher: In the class, we only have time to teach what is in the curriculum and that is a problem because a lot of students come to school with poor foreknowledge.*

*Parent: Individual work is one of the main reasons why parents opt for private lessons for their children.*

*Parent: In those moments, parents feel helpless and the only solution they see is in private lessons.*

Private tutoring has become a good disguise for corruptive behavior of teachers who abuse their position and status.

In order to discuss the phenomenon of private tutoring as adequately as possible, it is necessary to stress the shortcomings of the overall system, since the education system is an object and private tutoring is its shadow. It would be unreasonable to expect that the research of this scope can change/reform the system in its entirety; however, it can provide an insight into those elements of the system which need improvement.

The education system in BiH is facing a series of problems. That aside, we still cannot expect the formal schooling to be able to satisfy all educational needs of all students. This is why additional private tutoring should exist as an option but not in a way to take over the role and the task of the formal education system.

*Teacher: Teachers are not adequately paid for their work; we have a very important and responsible role and that should be appreciated.*

*Representative of the Ministry of Education: The problem is that additional classes in the regular school system do not offer anything new to students; teachers repeat what they already said in the same way and students do not see the point.*

*Representative of the teachers' association: I know some teachers who at the same time provide private lessons, who will not give a passing grade to a student if he or she did not take his private lessons.*

*Representative of the Institute of Pedagogy: Parents are now paying teachers to spend time with their children, to help them with homework or just to be with them, because they do not have time for that.*

### **Poor parenting?**

The style of parenting also occurs as one of the main causes of private tutoring. Parents opt for the services of private tutoring for various reasons. Social and economic changes also caused the changes in a lifestyle and the time crunch appears to be the most common justification for the need for private tutoring.

Parents are not sufficiently included in education of their children – they do not have patience, knowledge and/or skills to help their children and often think that it is only the school that should provide education not them as well.

On the other hand, the question is what the inclusion of parents in their children's education in fact implies?

Not all parents have necessary capacities to help their children in their education and rightly expect the school to be the one that should ensure that a child, for example, is able to do homework on his own; however, that is often not the case.

What certainly can and must be expected of parents is to support their children; to have general knowledge about the school environment that their children are in and the assignments given to them, to follow the work of their children, and to communicate with teachers who educate their children.

An equally important element which lies in the background of private tutoring is insufficient or non-existent communication and cooperation between the school, the teacher, the parent and the student. Parents are not partners in the educational process and that has a substantial impact on educational achievements of their children.

*Parent: If a child knows that the parent can and is willing to pay for private lessons, the child will rely on that; why would he make an effort in school when he has got a private tutor waiting for him at home.*

Parents think that the formal system cannot provide quality education, which they care about, and are in a way forced to look for an alternative. However, in case of private tutoring, it is unclear how much it has to do with the quality education and knowledge and how much it is the easier way to satisfy the requirements of the formal education and achieve short-term effects, which in the end comes down to getting a satisfactory grade in school.

*Parent: Some major changes in our education system will not happen any time soon so it would be best to make those private lessons available to all, and to organize them in such a way to be affordable to everybody.*

### **You will value what you pay for?**

The decline of social values, which is often stated as one of the causes of the onset of private tutoring, implies loss of trust into the system of education and change of perception of importance and value of education. Knowledge is not something that is valued anymore, even in case of private tutoring.

*Representative of the teachers' trade union: On the subject of private lessons, the interest of teachers lies in the financial gain, the interest of students is in getting a better grade, and nobody thinks about the value of education.*

Knowledge became a product which sells and in the context of private tutoring we can justifiably presume that something that is free of charge, such as formal education, is not valuable while something that is paid for, such as services of private tutoring, has its value.

*Teacher: Some students value only the education that they pay for.*

In view of the fact that the market of private tutoring is so widespread, anybody can provide the services of private tutoring and the quality of the services provided cannot be guaranteed since nobody controls them. This depreciates the teaching profession, teachers lose their status in the society, and formal education, to which everybody contributes equally- education authorities, teachers, parents and students alike- is degraded.

*Representative of the teachers' trade union: It is obvious that anybody can teach today, you do not need to be educated for that, you do not even need to know anything about the basics of pedagogy and methodology.  
Teachers are marginalized; they lost their authority both in society and in class.*

The identified causes of PT are: inadequate system of education (formal and informal), inadequate or non-existent cooperation between school, teacher, parent and student and loss of trust in the system of education and change of perception of importance and value of education.

## **Where to from here?**

### **Proposals and recommendations for regulation of private tutoring in BiH**

A series of options has been suggested for possible solutions to the problems caused by private tutoring; however, the proposed solutions are not very diverse or detailed in their description, especially with respect to their practicability and mode of implementation. The reason for that can be lack of systematic approach and analysis of the problems caused by private tutoring by education authorities as well as an opinion of some representatives of the education system that private tutoring as a phenomenon should not be treated separately.

Having analyzed the proposed options, those which met the following criteria have been selected:

- Feasibility and compatibility with the context of Bosnia and Herzegovina
- Less demanding with respect to financial and material means
- Less need for reorganization of the current structure of education

Below is a description of proposals and recommendations for regulation of private tutoring in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

### **Legal regulation of private tutoring**

Provision of services of private tutoring is not regulated by any law in Bosnia and Herzegovina (at cantonal, entity or state level). Private tutoring represents a form of additional teaching which is present and which needs to be regulated by law.

The efficiency of legal regulation with respect to control and reduction of use of the services of private tutoring is under question since in reality, even the existing laws are not being implemented fully and the implementation of the laws is rarely monitored. On the other hand, the change of the current situation needs to begin somewhere.

Some teachers abuse their position by giving private lessons to the same students they teach in regular classes. A formal ban of such a practice of the teachers is perceived as necessary.

School statutes and laws related to education at all levels should be revised with regard to this issue.

Parents, schools and teachers should initiate these changes while relevant ministries of education and professional organizations should bring these issues to the higher level and support formal regulation of private tutoring. Schools and institutes of pedagogy should be put in charge of supervision and monitoring of the implementation, i.e. application of new provisions. Disciplinary measures such as fines and cautions placed in the teacher's file are suggested for those teachers who fail to abide by new provisions.

Income generated by provision of the services of private tutoring is not taxed since there is no law which would oblige the providers to pay taxes for this kind of activity. The legal regulation of this segment of the phenomenon of private tutoring is also recommended; however, representatives of educational institutions do not see themselves as launchers of this initiative.

Subsequent to the above, one form of legal regulation of private tutoring requires regulation at the level of the school; namely, who can provide services, when and to whom. The second form of regulation pertains to the formal system of education; what is private tutoring in the context of the education system in BiH, what forms of private tutoring exist, is the registration and accreditation of the providers necessary, what are the standards for provision of services of private tutoring, etc. The third form of regulation relates to the economic aspect of private tutoring, i.e. taxation of income.

### ***Reorganization of additional classes in the formal system of education***

Additional classes in the formal system of education are guaranteed by laws on education in BiH. According to these laws, additional classes should be organized whenever a student needs that kind of assistance. They also say that the school is obliged, during elementary schooling, to monitor the interests and affinities of students and help them make decisions important for their future education (Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina, 2003).

Additional classes are part of the existing practice in schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina, they are free of charge and they fall under the scope of work of teachers.

Unfortunately, additional classes do not achieve their purpose for a series of reasons; they are not held regularly or are held very rarely, they are in most cases organized only for students who have negative grades, the work program does not differ from that of regular classes, and students show low interest in this form of classes.

Even though schools are facing many problems – problems of funding, staff, work space, schedule and organization of classes, the suggested options are aimed at the level of school since it is believed that schools themselves are able to make necessary changes.

Reorganization of the existing additional classes needs to begin by introducing and/or improving cooperation between teachers from the same school who teach the same school subjects. Teachers together with school pedagogues and psychologists should form a platform for additional education in their school. It is desirable for the school staff to have a joint discussion about the problem of additional education, to define a new approach and explore a possibility for including parents. Teachers who teach a particular school subject, such as math or English language, should communicate and consult almost every day in order to identify a possible problem (with a particular student or particular material) on time. The program, organization and purpose of additional classes should be the result of a joint effort of school staff. Additional classes should be regulated and harmonized at the level of the school, not at the level of the class.

Teachers, school principals and parents should be initiators of these changes.

In order to improve additional classes in formal education, it is recommended that the classes be held regularly based on the work schedules of the school. Mandatory delivery of additional classes for all those students who receive a negative grade requires modification of school laws which is still seen as a possibility worth considering.

The main reason for the low interest of students in additional classes is the same mode of work and the same lecturer teaching them in regular classes.

Rotation of subject teachers in one school or exchange of teachers between the schools is perceived as a solution which would have a positive effect both on the level of attendance and popularization of additional classes.

Reorganization of the existing mechanisms of the formal system of education is necessary since the schools already have the tools to adequately respond to educational needs of students, but they do not use them properly. In that case, the parents' remarks that private tutors are in fact doing the job of teachers can be seen as legitimate.

### ***Involvement of students of teaching and pedagogical colleges***

As part of their regular education, students of teaching and pedagogical colleges must take practical classes by going to elementary and secondary schools. This existing form of their development represents a unique opportunity to include these students in delivery of additional lectures in schools by having them assist teachers and teach themselves. In this way, future teachers acquire necessary experience and knowledge, teachers-mentors provide important support to their future colleagues, and students receive additional education which is different from regular classes.

Of course, this type of involvement of students should be preceded by establishment of cooperation between schools and colleges to be able to credit the involvement of students in the organization of additional classes as part of their practical classes and professional development.

It is necessary to discuss and identify adequate methods and possibilities to motivate students, schools and teachers for this type of involvement (e.g. additional credits for students, financial top-up for teachers-mentors and similar).

Schools and teaching colleges are perceived as launchers of this initiative, while institutes of pedagogy are seen as institutions which need to provide all necessary expert support.

### ***Peer teaching***

Peer teaching, which is known in the education practice and which was quite present in the former system of education, is neglected today. This form of learning is valued because it encourages social integration among students, develops the ability of students to share and impart knowledge and represents a good opportunity for team work. Even though students do not have necessary methodological knowledge for teaching, they have the advantage of being able to reach better mutual understanding with students.

Peer teaching deserves to be revived and schools are capable of doing that on their own. Teachers and school principals are once again those who should initiate these actions.

One of the ways is to form student groups in the class or in the school, which would represent another form of additional education, apart from regular, additional classes. The activities of student groups can be organized within one school subject or as an extracurricular activity.

The organization of workshops also represents an opportunity for improvement of peer teaching. Within individual school subjects, it is recommended to encourage students to design and deliver workshops on the topics relating to the problem of learning, understanding certain material or problems of regular classes. It is the school administration, teachers and student council who should guide and encourage students to initiate this type of activity.

Another way to encourage students to get involved in peer teaching is inclusion of successful students in the existing additional classes by having them assist teachers. Teachers and students should decide together about which form of motivation and reward is adequate for students who teach their peers.

The recommendation is to encourage students to use group and team work during regular classes since peer teaching should not be perceived as something that only underachievers need; rather as something that represents a desirable way of work and learning.

### **Registration and accreditation of agencies/organizations for additional education**

The suggested options for regulation of private tutoring outside the formal system of education imply registration and accreditation of private agencies and/or nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) which will provide services of additional education.

The issue to be addressed is the quality, standardization and monitoring of work of such organizations.

One of the recommended solutions is that teachers who are successful in their work, who achieve good results and who have good professional reputation get involved in the work of those private agencies/NGOs as tutors, mentors or advisors.

Expert supervision should be conducted by the institutes of pedagogy, which can be organized similarly to the monitoring of the work of preschool institutions since some kindergartens are private. Cooperation with the institutes of pedagogy and other professional organizations in the area of education (e.g. Agency for Preschool, Elementary and Secondary Education) is necessary as the work of these newly established agencies/organizations should comply with certain educational standards and criteria.

“Formalization“ of additional education may have negative effects on the formal system of education and can lead to the increased number of private schools in the long-term. On the other hand, registration of agencies and/or NGO's represents one of only few possible ways to organize and regulate a chaotic market of private tutoring at this moment.

Proposals of possible solutions to the problems caused by private tutoring:

- Legal regulation of PT
- Reorganization of additional classes in the formal system of education
- Involvement of students of teaching and pedagogical colleges in delivery of additional classes
- Peer teaching
- Registration and accreditation of agencies/organizations for additional education

Almost all proposed options for regulation of private tutoring are aimed at the level of school since it is necessary to initiate changes within the existing formal education structures. If the existing formal schooling mechanisms are improved, which is possible and feasible, negative aspects of private tutoring will certainly be reduced, which is when we will be able to talk about upgrading knowledge rather than catching up on missed lectures in the context of private tutoring.

The follow-up of the research on private tutoring in Bosnia and Herzegovina is necessary as educational institutions and decision makers in the education system must have relevant official data on trends, forms and functions to be able to respond adequately within the framework of the formal system and implement preventive actions with regard to negative effects of private tutoring.

## Annex – List of Participants

Representatives of the education system	Institution/organization
Representatives of ministries of education	Ministry of Education of Republika Srpska Ministry of Education of FBiH Ministry of Education, Science and Culture of Herzegovina-Neretva Canton Ministry of Education, Science and Culture of Tuzla Canton Ministry of Education, Science and Culture of Canton Sarajevo Department for Education of the Brčko District of BiH
Representatives of professional organizations in the area of education	Pedagogical Institute RS Pedagogical Institute Mostar Pedagogical Institute Tuzla Canton Agency for Preschool, Elementary and Secondary Education
Representatives of political parties dealing with the issues of education	Opposition political party in FBiH Opposition political party in RS
Representatives of nongovernmental organizations/stakeholders dealing with the issues of education	Council of Parents of Canton Sarajevo Forum of Parents of Republika Srpska
Representatives of teachers' trade unions	Trade union of Secondary and Higher Education of Canton Sarajevo Trade Union of Education, Science and Culture of Republika Srpska
Providers of services of private tutoring	Association of Young Linguists and Interpreters in BiH College of Electrical Engineering, Banja Luka
Teachers of elementary and secondary schools	Teachers of math of two elementary and secondary schools from Sarajevo
Parents	Parents of students of elementary and secondary schools who use the services of private tutoring

Table 1 Institutions/organizations whose representatives participated in the research

## Bibliography

- ✓ Baker, D.P. i LeTendre, G.K. (2005). *National Differences, Global Similarities: World Culture and the Future of Schooling*. Stanford University Press.
- ✓ Bray, M. (1999). *The shadow education system: private tutoring and its implications for planners*. UNESCO: International Institute for Educational Planning, Paris.
- ✓ Bray, M., Unesco, & Planning, I. I. F. E. (2009). *Confronting the Shadow Education System: What Government Policies for what Private Tutoring?* United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization.
- ✓ Parliamentary Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina. (2003). *Framework Law On Primary And Secondary Education in Bosnia and Herzegovina*.
- ✓ Silova, I., Budiene, V., & Bray, M. (2006). *Education in a hidden marketplace. Overview and Country Reports*. Open Society Institute. Retrieved from <http://promente.org/OSF1-PT-reg-e.pdf>



proMENTE provides consulting services of social research and solutions both for companies and nonprofit organizations. proMENTE operates internationally and is located in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

The Education Policy Center proMENTE provides research and support services in order to improve education policies and is part of the Network of Education Policy Centers – NEPC, whose goal is to promote education policies which are flexible, participatory, based on facts, transparent and promote the values of open society.

[www.promente.org](http://www.promente.org)

[info@promente.org](mailto:info@promente.org)

Tel/fax: +387 33 556 866

Kranjčevićeva 35, 71000 Sarajevo  
Bosnia and Herzegovina



