EDUCATION IN BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA: WHAT DO WE (NOT) TEACH CHILDREN?

Content Analysis of Textbooks of the National Group of Subjects in Primary Schools
EDUCATION IN BOSNIA AND HERZEGOVINA: WHAT DO WE (NOT) TEACH CHILDREN?
Content Analysis of Textbooks of the National Group of Subjects in Primary Schools
(Short Report)

The study was conducted by the Open Society Fund BH and proMENTE Social Research, and funded by the Open Society Education Support Program.

Editorial board: Andrea Soldo, Dženana Trbić, Dženana Husremović, Nenad Veličković, Ivona Čelebičić and Namir Ibrahimović

Researchers: Andrea Soldo (research project leader), Adila Salibašić, Adisa Marshall, Damir Šabotić, Edin Radušić, Fahrudin Biço, Melisa Forić, Namir Ibrahimović, Narcis Hadžiabdić, Nenad Veličković, Saša Buljević, Zlatiborka Popov Momčinović and Zurijeta Smajić

Help with data input and processing: Maja Alihodžić, Ozrenka Čamdžić and Esad Bratović

Cover illustration: Dušan Petričić

Translation into English: Radojka Jevtić

Sarajevo, March 2017
Table of Contents

1 INTRODUCTION ......................................................................................................... 4
2 THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK ....................................................... 5
3 GOALS, TASKS AND METHODOLOGY OF RESEARCH .................................................. 15
  3.1 The subject of analysis ............................................................................................. 16
  3.2 Methodology ........................................................................................................... 17
  3.3 Criteria and indicators ............................................................................................. 19
4 RESULTS .................................................................................................................... 24
  4.1 Universal human values .......................................................................................... 26
  4.2 Critical thinking ...................................................................................................... 52
5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................................. 61
6 ANNEX ....................................................................................................................... 67
7 BIBLIOGRAPHY .......................................................................................................... 76
1 INTRODUCTION

Textbooks still have a central role in the learning and teaching process in primary schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina. On the one hand, they represent the main corpus of knowledge that students need to acquire and, on the other, a means to achieve the educational goals set up in the curriculum. One of their distinct functions is to help develop a worldview system together with beliefs and values, which stem from the ideological framework in society. Therefore, they explicitly exhibit goals and visions of not only education, but also society in general, the way it is shaped and perceived by ruling political structures.

The first analysis of textbooks conducted by the Open Society Fund BH and proMENTE Social Research in 2007 aimed at establishing and defining the basic principles and values the education system promoted on the example of the national group of subjects. The results showed that education, through its content and structure, encourages segregation and division within the BH society. Instead of securing knowledge and skills necessary for a life in a plural society, the textbooks contribute to the creation of antagonism and serve as an instrument for the separation of students on an ethnic basis. The results also showed that textbooks did not support an individualised approach in teaching, critical thinking or research.

In the meantime, a new concept of inclusive nine-year primary education was introduced throughout the country within the comprehensive education reform process. It stated that the “ultimate goal of education is to improve the quality of life,” and that the changes in upbringing and education were oriented towards “the democratization and humanization of the education system, with the focus on enabling the pupils to satisfy their own needs and the needs of a modern democratic society.” In accordance with this model of a new school as a “professional learning community,” new textbooks were developed for all nine grades of primary school, which are still in use today.

In the analysis that follows, we attempted to examine to what extent the “new” textbooks of the national group of subjects are in accordance with the contemporary pedagogic principles advocated by this new education concept, such as interculturalism, universal values and human rights, integrated learning and teaching and critical thinking development.

The research was conducted by teams of experts on individual subjects – mother tongue, history, geography and religious education – by using the method of content analysis during the 2015-2016 school year.

We hope that the findings and recommendations which stem from the research will contribute to the improvement of the quality of textbooks in the context of the current curricular reform which is being initiated at various levels of education in Bosnia and Herzegovina with the aim of providing young people with key competences necessary for personal fulfilment and development, active citizenship, social engagement and employment.
2 THEORETICAL AND CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Educational goals in BH

In strategic documents for the education reform of 2002 and the Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education in Bosnia and Herzegovina adopted in 2003, the accent was placed on respecting human rights, equal opportunities for all and interculturalism.

In the first promise in the Message to the Citizens of BH, it is stated: We, the ministers of education, will ensure that all children have access to quality education in integrated multicultural schools, education which is free of political, religious, cultural and other prejudice and discrimination; which respects the rights of all children.

The Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education, Article 3 stipulates: The general goals of education arise from the generally accepted, universal values of the democratic society, and from proper value systems based on the specific qualities of the ethnic, historical, cultural and religious traditions of the peoples and ethnic minorities living in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

Accordingly, pursuant to the general education goals, the education system should enable access to knowledge as basis for understanding of self, others and the world we live in and ensure equal opportunities for education and opportunity of choice at all levels of education, regardless of sex, race, ethnic affiliation, social status, religion, psychophysical and other personal features.

The goals defined in the curricula and programmes for primary schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina are in line with these goals. Although differently phrased, there are three goals pertinent to the Framework Curriculum for the Nine-Year Primary School in the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Curriculum for the Nine-Year Primary Schools in the Croatian Language in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Curriculum for Primary Education in the Republic of Srpska. They include the development of a set of personal qualities (e.g. independence, exploratory spirit, communicativeness, honesty), encouraging the willingness of pupils to accept the role of responsible citizens and teaching the values worthy of man, as well as developing the ability of critical thinking, problem solving, i.e. systematic way of learning.

Textbooks play a considerable role in achieving these goals, seeing as they are defined as basic and mandatory school book/teaching aid that is the sources of knowledge and the didactic, educational means whose use enables achieving educational goals and knowledge standards determined by the plan.

---

1 Message to the Citizens of Bosnia and Herzegovina: Education Reform, 2002
2 Official Gazette of BH, No. 18/03
3 Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education, Official Gazette of BH, No. 18/03).
The role of textbooks in achieving education goals

From a theoretical point of view, the definition and the understanding of the notion “textbook” is quite wide; a textbook can be any material used in teaching, including all books in the context of school, as well as schoolbooks; or, it can refer to a specific, prescribed book. Bearing this in mind, it is not surprising that there are different approaches in defining a textbook, and, with it, different functions textbooks have.

In her paper Textbook as a Tool for Construction and Co-construction of School Knowledge (2013), Slobodanka Antić points to four approaches to defining a textbook.

The first one includes the so-called dictionary definitions of textbooks, which have in common that they define a textbook as a book, while the school context in which they are used, the content of the subject and the degree of obligation of using them is what differentiates them. According to these definitions, textbooks are books for learning specific content or subject, so the most important role of a textbook is to ensure representative contents for learning.

Another group of definitions defines the textbook through its pedagogic function, which may differ.

French textbook researcher Alain Choppin (according to Antić 2013) defines a textbook through four functions it has in the educational process:

- It is referent for the curriculum – the textbook is the main, and sometimes the only source of information for the educational content and it represents an interpretation of the curriculum;

- It has an instrumental function – it points to learning methods, offers work activities, and structures progress in learning;

- It has an ideological (cultural) function – textbooks correspond to the time and space in which they are made and they represent the framework for an, often implicit, value system or a desirable way of thinking; and a documentary function – documents, records or iconic means can be found in textbooks, which are presented without additionally guiding learners, thus encouraging their reasoning and critical thinking

---

4 In only two cantons (the Posavina Canton and the West Herzegovina Canton) in the Federation BH are textbooks defined and regulated by law and the Rulebook on the Procedure for Preparing and Publishing Textbooks and Other Teaching Aids for Primary and Secondary Schools (Federal Ministry of Education and Science, 2009). In the Republic of Srpska, the Draft Law on Textbooks in Primary and Secondary Schools from 2010 was never adopted.
The functions that Jaan Mikk, an Estonian researcher, listed in his book *Textbook: Research and Writing*, should be added to these functions. Mikk believes (according to Antić 2013) that the first and foremost function of textbooks is to motivate pupils to learn. Another function is to present information so that it is adapted and adjusted to the age of the children the textbook is intended for. That would mean that the textbook has a function of systematizing information and establishing coordination with achieving other education goals. Furthermore, another function of a textbook is to guide pupils in their learning activities by teaching them different learning strategies and supporting the development of the self-evaluation of the learning process. A special function of a textbook is to enable differentiated learning, i.e. to respond to various learning needs of different pupils. Finally, a textbook has a function of fostering a value and belief system that is in accordance with science and culture. It is important to bear in mind that there is no value-neutral textbook and that values and beliefs have been implicitly embedded in textbooks for years (Mikk 2000, according to Antić 2013).

The third group of textbook definitions brings the political, cultural and ideological dimension to the fore. Bearing in mind that different interest groups (pedagogues, authors, publishers, education authorities) take part in designing, making and publishing a textbook, that textbooks are intended for different users (teachers, pupils, parents) and that the motives of each of these groups differ, it is not surprising that textbooks can sometimes be at the centre of different and sometimes opposing interests of culture, pedagogy, publishing and society.

Some education sociologists and representatives of critical pedagogy (such as Purves, Bowles & Gintis, Bourdieu, Apple, Craford; according to Antić 2013) believe that textbooks, like schools, cannot be separated from the political context and that they cannot be spoken of as isolated entities, pure knowledge or pure pedagogic practice. Textbooks, like schools, participate in the reproduction of the elementary stratification of society and social inequalities; they are based on the cultural, ideological and political power of dominant social groups and they strive to carry out and strengthen cultural hegemony through the promotion of joint values and the construction of common historical memory (Antić 2013).

Finally, the fourth approach adds the dimension of the implicit to all of the above, that is, the fact that textbooks are agents in a social context and that they, as such, necessarily undergo value, cultural and folk-psychological transformations which often remain unspoken. Therefore, a textbook can be observed as a complex phenomenon which represents the link between the formal curriculum and the real one, carried out in class (Berman 1987, according to Antić 2013); or a means which operates in the grey zone between society and family, science, propaganda, special subjects and general education, adults and children (Johnsen 2001, according to Antić 2013). Accordingly, from the perspective of culture, textbooks serve to (re)produce culture, and they are a means to transfer and mediate various patterns and models of culture and socialisation, as well as intellectual patterns (Antic 2013).

It is clear from all of the above that textbooks represent an effective educational technology and it is highly likely that they will keep an important, if not central, role in modern education systems, which is why it is necessary to pay special attention to the content, role and function that textbooks have.
On research and textbook analysis

We can speak of textbook research within three areas: textbook content analysis (special attention is paid to the way the material is selected and presented), the way pupils and teachers use textbooks and the area of researching different stages of textbook development, starting with their conceptualisation to distribution (Johnsen 2001).

The findings of a comprehensive survey of literature and textbook research which Johnsen presented in his book, Textbooks in the Kaleidoscope: A Critical Survey of Literature and Research on Educational Texts, show that a very small number of textbook research refers to the process of writing (construction), developing and distributing textbooks; that there is some more research done on the application and use of textbooks, but that they are mostly based on theories of text readability and do not include its application in a teaching context so much; and that the dominant methodological approach to textbook research is content analysis, which varies from being impressionist and argumentative, to precise quantitative research.

The findings further suggest that the textbook is still the basic didactic means, that the application of textbooks in teaching varies, that we know little of how pupils use textbooks, and that a corresponding methodological approach which could study that has not yet been found (Johnsen 2001).

These results are proven relevant for the Bosnian-Herzegovinian context, where several significant research projects which included textbook analyses mostly based on content analysis have been carried out since the end of the 1990s.

One of those was the research conducted by the Open Society Fund BH and proMENTE Social Research in 2007. That was the first content analysis of textbooks of the national group of subjects aimed to examine to what extent the educational content was:

------------

5 Popov-Momčinović, Z. 2006. Textbooks of Islamic, Orthodox and Catholic religious education in BH – Is there a place for tolerance and interreligious dialogue? Faculty of Philosophy East Sarajevo.


in accordance with principles and goals set in the Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education and the Education Reform Strategy;

dedicated to working on the integration of society, the democratization process and establishing the rule of law.

The results of the research showed that, both in its contents and structure, education in BH encourages segregation and division within the society. Instead of securing knowledge and skills necessary for a life in a plural society, textbooks of the national group of subjects contribute to creating antagonism and serve as instruments of separating pupils on an ethnic basis. The results also showed that textbooks do not support an individualized approach to teaching, critical thinking and research.

In the meantime, the ministries of education introduced new textbooks within the reform and the introduction of the nine-year primary education. Open Society Fund BH and proMENTE, together with Education Support Program of Open Society Foundations decided to do a new textbook analysis in order to establish whether and to what extent the “new” textbooks of the national group of subjects are pursuant to modern pedagogical principles such as interculturality, universal values and human rights, integrated learning and teaching and developing critical thought.

Conceptual framework

The conceptual framework for the analysis, as in the previous research, rests on basic education principles in an open society, education whose aim is the optimal development of potential and the fulfilment of the pupil’s individuality. They include:

- **social justice**: implies securing quality education for all, with the respect of different educational needs, especially the needs of the marginalized, endangered and disenfranchised groups in society;

- **interculturalism**: education contents and teaching and learning methods encourage complete understanding of oneself and others, develop a sense of solidarity with other people and respect for the pluralistic society;

- **respecting human rights**: education institutions guarantee group and individual rights of all members of the society and promote the respect of universal values and the richness of diversity through the integration process (as opposed to segregation or assimilation);

- **education as public good**: quality education places a pupil and his or her needs at the centre of attention and, at the same time, strives to advance the entire society in the long run.

With this in mind, we decided to pay special attention in the analysis to the identification of contents which: a) encourage understanding of oneself and others, b) connect teaching and learning with experience and interest of pupils and c) contribute to developing and shaping the school community as the microcosm of an open society.
The content and values promoted in the education system have significant implications for the entire society, because the stances pupils adopt will have an important role in shaping their worldview and their relation to themselves and others.

Textbooks can contribute greatly to raising awareness on universal human values with the pupils or they can, on the other hand, deepen authoritarian, uncritical stances which are completely contrary to those values.

**On values as educational outcomes**

Values take a central position in learning theory and practical activities in school in two ways. First, the school and teachers, aside from family, media and peers, have a great influence on the development of children’s values. Second, schools reflect and incorporate social values and owe their existence to the fact that society values education. Thus, society itself influences its further development through education (Hastead and Taylor 1996).

When we talk about values, we are actually talking about what is important to us in life. Values help us estimate what is right and what is wrong, what is desirable and what is undesirable. When we talk about moral development, we are actually talking about the development of a system of values as an organised system of beliefs on standards and principles which control the process of making moral decisions. Every person has a set of values which they believe to be more or less important (for instance, liberty, justice, religion, achievement, material well-being). Values are not equally important to everyone. For instance, material well-being can be the highest value to one person, but completely irrelevant to another.

There are many theories which explain what values are, and one of them is Schwartz’s theory (1992, 2006), which provides an overview of characteristics of values that are mentioned in other theories, too.

1. Values are beliefs inseparable from emotions. Once a value has been activated, the person is at that moment filled with the emotion connected with the value. For instance, a person who values equality highly will get outraged, angry or sad when others discriminate against them, and happy when they are treated equally.

2. Values are connected with goals we set for ourselves (a person who sees helping others as a value will define his or her career and personal goals so that they include the activity of helping others).

3. Values are reflected in various life situations and that differentiates them from norms and stances, which are usually connected with specific objects or situations.

4. Values are criteria which control the choice and estimate of behaviour, people, events or policies. People estimate what is good or bad, right or wrong, depending on what value is to them.
5. Values are organised in a hierarchical system. Therefore, some values are more important than others. A runner who helps another, tired runner to finish the race, demonstrates with his act that helping another person is more important to him than achievement as a value.

6. Most decisions we make include activating more than one value.

According to Schwartz, these characteristics apply to all values, and what differentiates them is their goal or the motivation they reflect. Values are individual characteristics, but their organisation and importance depend on collective values (that is, values of the groups to which the individual belongs) and shared values of a society, seeing as the development of values as a system starts quite early and is affected by a string of factors – mainly primary family, and then school.

Teaching values has always been a part of the education system. Values have always been connected with the upbringing component, and today they are seen as an inseparable component of education outcomes. There are various reasons for that, including:

1. fast changes in social structures, such as family and family life, employment and unemployment, mobility, global communication,

2. the growing imperative of constructing entrepreneurial and efficient societies where individual achievement for the common wellbeing is valued most, with an emphasis on intellectual and spiritual/religious development, wherein social and moral development lose importance,

3. the increasingly prominent emphasising of the model from public life such as politics, business and the entertainment world,

4. the strong influence of the media which form the perceptions of the public by broadcasting “facts,”

5. the perception of the public on the increase of anti-social behaviour and criminal acts.

Even though they have always been a part of education, values became especially visible with the promotion of key competences as education outcomes. There is a string of activities which were carried out, which are still being carried out in order to reform education systems from content-based curricula towards curricula based on education outcomes. In one of the most important documents, published in 2006, “Key Competences for Lifelong Learning – A European Framework,” the key competences necessary for personal growth and development, active citizen participation, social cohesion and employability in today’s society are defined and described. From the description, we can see that the focus today rests not only on academic achievements, but also on quality social and civic life. The same key competences are defined as (Gordon et al. 2009) a complex notion which exceeds cognitive aspects and additionally includes attitudes and capacities for action, that is, values. The European definition of competences within the European Qualification Framework (2012) includes autonomy and responsibility as inseparable parts of constructed competences.
Bosnia and Herzegovina has also taken up the obligation of carrying out the reform of education systems and their harmonization with European frameworks, which includes the transfer from classical, content-based curricula, to curricula directed at outcomes, as well as the shift of teaching with the goal of achieving curricular networking and cross-curricular effect for all competences. That also means that values, as parts of competences, must be clearly defined as education outcomes of the curricula of all subjects, but also extra-curricular activities, the climate and culture of the school.

We have already mentioned that values are organised hierarchically and that they can be scaled on the dimension of specificity, that is, universality, so that values taught in school can be divided into two categories (Halstead and Taylor 2000). The first category includes values inherent to the subject itself, which can be quite specific and linked to the field (e.g. evaluating sciences), while the other category encompasses values which are not specifically linked to the subject and are placed higher hierarchically by their width and universality – the so-called universal values, a set of values which transcends the borders of a society, community, culture or religion.

Adopting universal values, respecting them and recognising them as valid categories for all people in the world must be a part of the whole education process and life in school. Developing universal values, that is, internalising them into the individual system of cognition and behaviour, begins very early, with the very first elements of socialisation. In order for the process to be successful, it requires a certain amount of synchronisation between all participants in children’s socialisation – from their family and school, to the entire society. It is, therefore, important not to leave values in the hands of a single subject, but to make education outcomes important for everything the child learns and everything in which the child participates at the school level.

Taking into consideration the generally accepted values of the democratic society, the values which stem from the open society principle, and those which stem from valid documents which regulate education in BH (such as education laws and the Constitution of BH), a set of universal values which we believe textbooks should affirm was defined for the purpose of this research. Those values include: peace, cooperation, solidarity, liberty, responsibility, equality, life and love.

On critical thinking

Critical thinking is the intellectually disciplined process of actively and skilfully conceptualizing, applying, analyzing, synthesizing, and/or evaluating information gathered from, or generated by, observation, experience, reflection, reasoning, or communication, as a guide to belief and action.

(Scriven and Paul 1987)

The life of any individual is filled with demands to make judgments and decisions – from which profession we choose to how we act towards other people. We make decisions based on assumptions which may be true, but they also may be automatic, or assumptions we believe to be true because people we respect said so. In order to make good decisions, we need to question our assumptions and check their validity.
Critical thinking represents a necessary goal of education and education reforms in developing countries and it is presented as an imperative of the modern world for two reasons (Pešić 2003):

- the modern society needs citizens who think and make decisions independently and responsibly,
- the modern world is characterised by significant technological progress, a time of fast and constant change, individuals exposed to large quantities of information and a considerably increased level of availability of information which creates the need for an active, reasoned and questioning critical approach.

Buchberger (2012) defines critical thinking as a complex process and the result of the analysing and evaluating claims, finding justification for those claims, comparing them with other and/or opposite claims, generating objections to the claims, and, finally – adopting a stance.

Unlike reproductive thinking, where reflection is avoided and the opinions of others are repeated without questioning them, an individual who thinks critically while reading a certain text does not repeat what was read without questioning and with basic understanding. Basic understanding of information is only the starting position for further cognitive processes, such as searching for the justification for the claim supported, looking for objections for the opinion on a certain matter presented, etc. (Buchberger 2012).

When we think critically, we become aware of advantages and disadvantages, while our judgment is based on arguments and the awareness that matters are not black and white. Some idea can be sustained and developed only when questioned, only when its advantages, disadvantages, possibilities and dangers are known. Anything else is uncritical gullibility, and, as such, undesirable for any society.

Education is meant to help pupils develop the skill of recognising sources of assumptions by constantly asking – why. After that, the second phase of critical thinking includes examining how valid and reliable those assumptions are. In order for pupils to question their assumptions, they need several sources of information and different perspectives.

In the end, in the final phase of critical thinking, pupils make a decision, or accept the opinion/value/information, but now consciously, ready to provide arguments of their decisions in a rational manner, not because a book says so or because a teacher/parent/authority says so.

For the last twenty years, focus is being increasingly placed on the lack of skills and capacities in pupils as a primary inhibitory factor for the development of critical thinking (Geertsen 2003). In his paper, Geertsen lists three characteristics of pupils necessary for adopting and developing critical thinking – open-mindedness or openness to new experiences (respecting the opinions of others), empirical thinking (postponing making conclusions before arguments are stated), and perseverance in thinking (the readiness to explore all possibilities and change views when necessary). Egocentrism and sociocentrism in thinking, that is, treating one’s own perspective as the main one and the conviction that the opinion of the group the pupil belongs to is the best stand on the other end of the spectrum.
Taking into consideration the basic characteristics of critical and reproductive thinking, for the needs of this research, we defined the indicators used to estimate whether the contents of the textbooks included in the analysis instigate **critical thinking** (defined though active learning, problem solving, the multiple perspective approach and differentiated representation) or whether they affirm **reproductive thinking**, that is, the inability to discuss, the mere memorisation of facts, the single perspective approach and stereotypical representation.
3 GOALS, TASKS AND METHODOLOGY OF RESEARCH

The goals and tasks of the research were defined in accordance with the goals of the Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education in BH, promises made in the strategic document for the education reform from 2002 (Message to the Citizens of Bosnia and Herzegovina: Education Reform, 2002) and the programme strategy of the Open Society Fund BH, which includes the professional and democratic development of the Bosnian-Herzegovinian education system, the promotion of ethnic tolerance and cultural diversity, as well as advocating quality, equal education for all, which will set the foundation for a more inclusive society.

The aim of the research was to use the content analysis of textbooks of the national group of subjects and religious education to estimate the results of the textbook policy reform which was implemented in Bosnia and Herzegovina with the introduction of the nine-year primary education in the following areas:

- social cohesion, tolerance and interculturality,
- respect of human rights and basic liberties,
- critical thinking.

Research questions at the focus of the research included the following:

- Are values placed as education outcomes in curricula and the textbooks of the national group of subjects and religious education?
- Are universal values affirmed in the textbooks?
- Do the contents in the textbooks encourage the development of critical thinking?

In the process of carrying out the research, another research question was defined later – what is the dominant pedagogic function of the textbook:

- Instrumental – the function of the textbook is to point to the methods of learning and work activities in teaching, to guide pupils through their learning activities and motivate pupils to learn,
- Interpretative – the function of the textbook is to be the main (and basic) source of information, while the contents include the representation and systematisation of information on a certain topic and/or,
- Ideological and political – the function of the textbook is to correspond to the time and space in which it was made and, through its contents, to allude to a certain value system and or way of thinking?
The tasks of the research were:

- To identify contents which are relevant for the goals of the research in the textbooks,
- To create a register/base which will contain data on the places within the textbooks where the content which is the subject of the analysis can be found,
- To set aside contents which can be used for a public debate and discussion on the values; contents which need to be revised,
- To make recommendations for the improvement of education policies which include curricula and school textbooks.

### 3.1 THE SUBJECT OF ANALYSIS

The subject of analysis were contents of textbooks from the national group of subjects and religious education approved by proper ministries/education institutions for the school year 2014-2015. Seeing as curricula differ from one another based on the national group of subjects they encompass and seeing as they portray differences between the three constituent nations in BH, the following terms were used in the research: *curriculum in the Bosnian, Croatian and Serbian language.*

Textbooks from the following subjects were analysed:

- Mother tongue and literature (from grade six to grade nine)
- History (from grade six to grade nine)
- Geography (from grade six to grade nine)

---

6 The Federal Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Srpska, the Department of Education of the Brčko District and the Institute for Education Mostar (List of approved working textbooks, textbooks, handbooks, worksheets and workbooks for primary schools, secondary schools and secondary technical and vocational schools in the 2014-2015 school year; Catalogue of textbooks for primary schools for the 2014-2015 school year; List of mandatory textbooks and appurtenant supplementary teaching aids in the Croatian language in BH for the school year 2014-2015)

7 In the curriculum in the Bosnian language, the national group of subjects includes Bosnian language and literature, history, geography and predominantly Islamic religious education; in the curriculum in Croatian – Croatian language and literature, history, geography and predominantly Catholic religious education, while in the curriculum in Serbian, it includes Serbian language and literature, history, geography and predominantly Orthodox religious education. Schools situated in the area with Bosniak majority teach in accordance with the curriculum in the Bosnian language, schools in the area with Croatian majority teach in accordance with the curriculum in the Croatian language, while schools in the area with Serbian majority teach in accordance with the curriculum in the Serbian language.
Religious education (from grade six to grade nine)

The selection of textbooks was carried out in relation to the three set criteria:

- For one subject and one grade, at least one textbook was chosen for a single curriculum, and three at the most,
- The textbook is used in most schools
- Textbooks whose authors are a part of the research team were not the subject of analysis.

### 3.2 METHODOLOGY

The method of content analysis was used to carry out the research.

The goal of applying the method of content analysis is the description of certain contents, clarification, explication, finding and interpreting the meaning of the contents. By applying this method, we are contextualising the content and trying to understand its sense and meaning, as well as observing the intentions and goals the authors can have in relation to the readers, that is, children, as primary users of textbooks.

Within the analysis, we combined the quantitative approach (the frequencies of repeating certain content in the analysed textbooks) and the qualitative approach (analysing and interpreting texts with the purpose of understanding the meaning of the utterance – what the text is about, what message it relays and how the content is presented).

The research procedure included: sampling the material/textbooks, determining the unit of analysis and the content of the categories for analysis, training researchers, testing, coding, quantifying, analysing and interpreting the findings.

The unit of analysis was a lesson in the textbook, which was analysed with regard to predefined criteria and indicators. Aside from laws and promises, we took into consideration the principles of education for an open society when defining criteria – education as public good, interculturalism, social justice and the respect of human rights.

During the analysis of lesson contents, we took into consideration all those parts which can constitute a single lesson: the main text, the text on the margins, in the captions, quotes, questions, tasks and illustrations.

Teams of researchers were formed for the analysis of textbooks; every subject was assigned a team of three to four persons. The members of the team were chosen based on relevant experience in the field of research and teaching practice, as well as their professional actions focused on the improvement of education in BH.
In order to ensure a higher reliability of findings and minimise the effect of the subjectivity of researchers, the design of the research specified that every unit of analysis (lesson) would be analysed by two people independently, led by clearly defined indicators for content categorisation. When discrepancies and deviations in categorising or coding the content appeared, meetings of all members of the working group were held in order to discuss and ascertain how the analysed content would be categorised.

The tasks of researchers were to:

- Analyse textbook contents according to previously made analysis handbook which included advice for researchers and the descriptions of criteria, indicators and steps in analysis, as well as instruments for analysis,

- Participate in periodic meetings and cooperate with other members of the working team to discuss findings and possible obscurities, harmonise findings, keep record of progress and agree on further steps,

- Participate in making conclusions and recommendations.

Methodological limitations

Even though content analysis represents a dominant methodological approach in textbook research, it is necessary to list existing flaws and limitations of the application of this method.

Content analysis is a long and complex process, seeing as it requires a detailed study of content which is the subject of analysis, training researchers/analysts and conducting certain procedures in order to ensure a satisfactory reliability of results.

Factors which can influence the reliability of results, which are difficult to control, include potential bias and subjectivity of analysts/researchers in interpreting and drawing conclusions, as well as intraindividual and interindividual variability. The way different analysts/researchers understand content and context and make decisions on how to interpret it (especially when hidden content and messages are concerned) potentially influences the different categorisation of content, which can influence the reliability of results in the end.

Furthermore, the method of content analysis in this case allows for a textbook estimate as an independent factor in the learning process, but not the estimate of the effects of the teaching context and the teachers’ interventions when using textbooks and the pupils’ work on textbooks, so the results of the analysis need to be observed in that context.

Limited possibility of drawing conclusions on the role of pupils in learning represents an additional limitation of the research, seeing as its design specifies that a lesson in the textbook, and not the whole textbook, be the unit of analysis.
In addition, not all textbooks which can be found on the market and which are used in schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina were included in the analysis; rather, we chose a sample of textbooks for analysis through deliberate sampling, which could also influence the generalisation of the findings of the research.

### 3.3 CRITERIA AND INDICATORS

The criteria were defined so they could enable the estimate of the level the content follows the general education goals defined by the Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education and the documents for the education reform.

A total of two criteria were defined: (1) The affirmation of universal human values and (2) Encouraging the development of critical thinking.

#### The criterion of Universal Human Values

The general goals of education arise from the generally accepted, universal values of the democratic society, and from proper value systems based on the specific qualities of the ethnic, historical, cultural and religious traditions of the peoples and ethnic minorities living in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

(Article 3 of the Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education in BH)

Should the manuscript of the textbook and other teaching aid contain content which stands in opposition with the Constitution of the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina, that is, should it endanger, belittle or discriminate against groups or individuals on any basis, especially when it comes to national, religious, human and minority rights, basic liberties and relations between the sexes, as well as upbringing for democratic citizenship, regardless of its expert and other qualities, such a manuscript cannot receive a positive evaluation.

(Article 3 of the Rulebook on the Procedure for Preparing and Publishing Textbooks and Other Teaching Aids for Primary and Secondary Schools, Federal Ministry of Education and Science)

The criterion of *Universal Human Value* is defined so that it can enable the estimate of textbook contents in order to answer the following questions: *Do contents in textbooks support adopting and developing universal values and do they promote the respect of human rights and basic liberties? and How are values based on the particularities of the national, historical, cultural and religious tradition of the nations living in BH presented?*
| PEACE | Promoting peaceful solutions to conflicts, stressing the right to peace and non-violence as a basic human right. |
| COOPERATION | Encouraging dialogue and joint action. Respecting people regardless of their beliefs, culture, language. Pluralism is treated as a quality. |
| LIBERTY | The right to a dignified life without the fear of violence, oppression or injustice. Freedom of choice, speech, conscience, religion. Creativity. Respecting the liberty of others. |
| SOLIDARITY | Solidarity encompasses interpersonal, intercultural understanding and communication, the development of compassion and responsibility for oneself and the community. The respect for values and dignity of all people and care for the growth and development of others. |
| RESPONSIBILITY | The ability to differentiate right from wrong and willingness to assume responsibility for our own actions. |
| EQUALITY | The right and possibility to develop our own potential as human beings regardless of class, race, gender, origin. Rule of law, respect for human rights, and democracy. Fair division of resources, righteousness. |
| LIFE | Sovereignty, inviolability of the body. Quality life. The integrity of personality. |
| LOVE | Encouraging positive emotions (towards man, nature, life), connections with others, affiliation, devotion, affection, benevolence. |

The analysis sought to establish the following:

a) Are these values merely: **mentioned** (a notion which signifies a value is only listed declaratively or the meaning is explained, but the affirmation of the value is not encouraged) or **promoted** (the value is contextualised, space for discussion, thought, independent conclusion which leads to affirmation, development and adopting values is left) in textbooks.

b) How are contents which are connected with the following represented:⁸

- **joint origin** – Is a nation/people determined as a biologically, genetically connected group of people, while mixing with others is undesirable?

⁸ Source: Ideological Instrumentalisation of Literature in BH Textbooks of Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian Language and Literature on the Examples of Readers from Grade Five of Primary School to Grade Four of Secondary School (Veličković 2010).
• **equality of the sexes** – Is gender inequality problematized, or does it go without saying that men have more rights and liberties while women are invisible or neglected?

• **tradition** – Are common sources of different traditions being pointed out, or are customs uncritically presented as value?

• **territory** – Are soil, land, state (homeland) understood as property of the ethnic collective, gained through defence, victims, spilt blood and are its beauties and potentials glorified uncritically?

• **past** – Is history perceived as a string of events where the collective played the main role with the aim to show/prove its longevity, perseverance, sovereignty, and, in connection with that, its oldest right to the land?

• **mother tongue** – Is language represented as national treasure and a distinguishing, determining element of a group; first and foremost a means of identification, and then communication, while the “beauty” of the language, its excellence and exclusivity are pointed out?

• **piety** – Is religiousness reduced to “one religion” and spirituality on the respect of religious ordinances and rituals; is faith, like language, represented as an exclusivity of a collective, its important distinguishing and determining factor?

• **symbols** – Are flags, the anthem, and religious, traditional motifs represented as extremely significant factors of togetherness, which is why they are paid special respect without any critical distance?

**The criterion of Encouraging the Development of Critical Thinking**

The development of critical thinking and successful problem solving is listed as one of the goals and outcomes of educational work in all three curricula applied in BIH.

The criterion of *encouraging the development of critical thinking* was defined to enable the estimate of content in textbooks in order to provide answers to the question – *Do contents in textbooks encourage the development of the ability of critical thinking, providing arguments and applying what has been learnt?*

Lessons in textbooks of the national group of subjects and religious studies from grade six to grade eight/nine were analysed in relation to the set of defined indicators in order to estimate whether the contents of these textbooks encourage the development of critical thinking, or whether they affirm reproductive thinking; that is, whether contents in textbooks encourage active learning or not even offer the possibility of discussion, whether they encourage problem solving, or mere memorisation of facts, whether the multiple perspective approach or the single perspective approach is used, and
whether contents are represented with [differentiated, critical representations or stereotypical representations.]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITICAL THINKING INDICATORS (CMI)</th>
<th>REPRODUCTIVE THINKING INDICATORS (RTI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Active learning</strong> – the contents which ensure that participants are active in the learning process, that they construct understanding of what is learnt and apply the acquired knowledge and skills in real and everyday life. They develop the abilities of independent learning and the use of different methods of learning, adapted to age and needs, which encourage pupils to discuss, state their own opinion, provide arguments for it and listen to the opinions of others.</td>
<td><strong>The possibility of discussion is not offered</strong> - the indicator for those contents where facts are presented as ultimate truths which are not up for discussion. Such contents do not instigate debate on sensitive and controversial materials, nor do they enable learning with others in a class environment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Problem solving</strong> - contents which encourage pupils to experiment, set hypotheses, analyse and deduct, be creative and free to explore the world around them. They lead towards understanding of key scientific concepts and solving problem situations by helping pupils develop thinking abilities of the higher order - problem learning, learning through discovery, integrative learning, accelerative learning and research learning.</td>
<td><strong>Rote fact memorisation</strong> - the indicator for those contents which come down to listing and memorising facts, which does not ensure deeper and more lasting learning.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Multiple perspective approach</strong> - more sources and several perspectives are offered, which view a certain occurrence or problem differently. Pupils are guided towards additional literature in print/electronic forms, taught how to use multimedia technologies to download, estimate, prepare, create, present and exchange information, as well as how to evaluate their quality and relevance.</td>
<td><strong>Single perspective approach</strong> - contents which are based on a single perspective, where pupils do not have the chance to learn about different opinions and perspectives and where, in the end, different stances are treated explicitly as unacceptable and negative. Contents are in the textbook for merely perfunctory reasons, but not to be used in critical analysis and perceiving different perspectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Differentiated representations</strong> - contents which develop the social perception of people, groups or peoples. In a differentiated representation, what is used is verified</td>
<td><strong>Stereotypical representations</strong> - the contents where, based on limited and very simplified descriptions, general explanations of behaviour or qualities of entire groups are made. They often include sex,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**CRITICAL THINKING INDICATORS (CMI)**  
information, several sources and differentiations as bases for the development of objective social perceptions. They provide the pupils with the possibility of analytical thinking, develop an open and flexible stance towards others and one’s own group and question rooted stereotypes.

**REPRODUCTIVE THINKING INDICATORS (RTI)**  
race, ethnicity, origin and other characteristics. Prejudice leans on stereotypes, but it has an additional emotional charge, which can lead to discrimination.

| TABLE 1 CRITICAL AND REPRODUCTIVE THINKING INDICATORS |
4 RESULTS

A total of 2,668 lessons in 68 chosen textbooks from the national group of subjects (mother tongue and literature, history, geography) and religious education from grade six to grade nine which were approved for the school year 2014-2015 were analysed in the research. Thirty textbooks are used in schools which follow the curriculum in the Bosnian language, 20 textbooks are used in schools which follow the curriculum in the Croatian language and 18 are used in schools which follow the curriculum in the Serbian language, including the textbooks for the Islamic, Catholic and Orthodox religious education (Table 3).

Unlike the list of approved textbooks for schools which follow the curriculum in Serbian, which states that one textbook is assigned to every grade and every subject, the lists of approved textbooks for the curricula in Bosnian and Croatian contained more than one title for one subject and one grade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Number of textbooks</th>
<th>Number of lessons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>665</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language and literature (B/C/S)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>1055</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>224</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>17</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>602</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious education (Islamic, Catholic, Orthodox)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>12</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>346</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>68</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>2668</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 2 THE NUMBER OF ANALYSED TEXTBOOKS AND LESSONS IN RELATION TO THE SUBJECT AND GRADE
Out of the total number of analysed textbooks:

1. 36 (53%) are written in the Latin script;

2. 20 (29%) contains lessons in both scripts (including one textbook where only two lessons are written in the Cyrillic script),

3. 12 (18%) are written in the Cyrillic script.

As we can see from the table below, a bit more than half of analysed textbooks for the curriculum in the Bosnian language are written solely in the Latin script, while the remaining textbooks contain lessons written in both the Latin and the Cyrillic script. Out of the 18 analysed textbooks for the curriculum in the Serbian language, two-thirds are written in Cyrillic, while one third includes both scripts. All 20 textbooks for the curriculum in the Croatian language, which were included in the analysis, are written in the Latin script (Table 4).

---

9 The three national curricula are based on one of the basic human rights, the right to receive education in one’s mother tongue. Each of the three major ethnic communities in Bosnia and Herzegovina, the so-called three constituent nations, starts from the assumption that Bosnian, Croatian and Serbian are three different languages, which is not true. All three are actually one language, which had different names until the dissolution of socialist Yugoslavia (Serbo-Croatian, Croat-Serb, Croatian-Serbian, Serbian-Croatian, Serbian or Croatian, Croatian or Serbian; Croatian, that is, Serbian; Serbian, Croatian), which is recognised by the linguist Snježana Kordić (Language and Nationalism, 2010) as polycentric, with four different standards. This conclusion, as well as some others from her book Language and Nationalism, has not been disputed by the scientific community in Bosnia and Herzegovina. However, they have also not called into question the assumption that three different languages are in use instead of three different names for the same language.

Using this situation, the education authorities and domestic and international political subjects have allowed three separate education sectors with three different curricula which contain their own content to be established, using the right of one’s own language as cover. Consequently, within each of these sectors (programmes), children are introduced to content which is different from the other two and which is approached from a dominantly ethno-national perspective.
TABLE 4 THE NUMBER OF ANALYSED TEXTBOOKS IN RELATION TO THE USE OF SCRIPT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Script</th>
<th>Curriculum in Bosnian language</th>
<th>Curriculum in Croatian language</th>
<th>Curriculum in Serbian language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cyrillic</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin and Cyrillic</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the Framework Law on Primary and Secondary Education in Bosnia and Herzegovina, it is listed that the languages of the constituent peoples of Bosnia and Herzegovina shall be used at all schools, in concordance with the Constitution of Bosnia and Herzegovina and that all pupils at schools shall learn the alphabets that are in official use in Bosnia and Herzegovina (Article 7). In Article 18 of the Rulebook on the Procedure for Preparing and Publishing Textbooks and Other Teaching Aids for Primary and Secondary Schools (Federal Ministry of Education and Science 2009) it is also stated that school textbooks and other teaching aids can be issued in the Bosnian, Croatian and Serbian language and printed equally in scripts (alphabets) which are in official use in Bosnia and Herzegovina.

If textbooks, as the basic teaching aid, are written in only one language and script (as it is the case with the analysed textbooks for the curriculum in Croatian), knowing and using other official languages and scripts in regular teaching is made more difficult and/or impossible.

### 4.1 UNIVERSAL HUMAN VALUES

The criterion Universal Human Values refers to contents in textbooks which support the adoption and development of basic human values, such as peace, cooperation, liberty, solidarity, responsibility, equality, life and love.

The criterion supposes that these contents promote the universality of values and that values are not used to point out the significance, greatness, or the special nature of a single collective which is based on ethnic/national origin, territory, past, language or religion.

In curricula\(^{10}\) followed in teaching in primary schools in BH, it is not especially specified what values pupils should develop and adopt when taught geography, history, the Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian

This way language, which all speakers in Bosnia and Herzegovina use to communicate with one another without any difficulties (because differences in standards are negligible), has turned the education system into a means of political struggle.

\(^{10}\) Framework Curriculum for the Nine-year Primary School in the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina (2008), Curriculum for the Nine-year Primary Schools in the Croatian Language in Bosnia and Herzegovina (2008), Curriculum for Primary Education in the Republic of Srpska (2014)
language and literature and religious education. However, by examining the goals and outcomes of learning defined in these documents, several places where values are mentioned were identified.

In the curricula from grade six to grade nine, it is stated that within studying subjects geography, history, and religious education, values such as responsibility, cooperation, solidarity (humanity), equality and liberty should be affirmed and encouraged. Education goals of studying the subject language and literature are almost fully focused on adopting knowledge and mastering skills. In some of the goals, however, it is stated that pupils should develop a sense of beauty, righteousness, humanity; how they should respect others and those different from them, develop love towards all nations and perceive the importance of good interpersonal relations.

The results of the analysis show that contents which speak of universal values were recognised in less than one-third of analysed lessons in all textbooks included in the analysis (N=733). In 548 lessons, values are only mentioned, which means that the notion which signifies value is only declaratively stated, or, rather, its meaning is explained, but developing and adopting the values is not encouraged.

Only in 185 lessons (7% of the total number of analysed lessons) are values promoted, which means that the value is contextualised, the possibility of discussion is presented, while the contents encourage thinking, lead to deduction and encourage adopting values (Table 5).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Number of lessons</th>
<th>Values are mentioned</th>
<th>Values are promoted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Value is recognised in the lesson</td>
<td>733 (27 %)</td>
<td>548 (20 %)</td>
<td>185 (7 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value is not recognised in the lesson</td>
<td>1935 (73 %)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>2668 (100 %)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 5** THE REPRESENTATION OF UNIVERSAL VALUES IN THE TOTAL NUMBER OF ANALYSED LESSONS

The values that are most often recognised in the analysed contents are responsibility, equality and life. They are followed by liberty and cooperation, while solidarity, peace and love are recognised much more seldom.

In the table below (Table 6), the frequencies of examples for values are listed, that is, how many times a value is recognised in contents included in the analysis and what a value means. It is important to point out that the number of examples does not correspond to the number of lessons, that is, that one lesson could have contained several examples for different values, or it could have contained no examples for none of the stated values.
### TABLE 6 THE FREQUENCY OF RECOGNISED VALUES IN ANALYSED TEXTBOOKS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Frequency of examples in all textbooks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility (responsibility to oneself, others, the environment, cultural and historical heritage, work)</td>
<td>317</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality (equality, fairness, righteousness, honesty)</td>
<td>213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life (well-being, optimism, humour, happiness)</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberty (security, creativity/art/beauty, knowledge/science/education, truth)</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation (pluralism, togetherness, coexistence, tolerance, cosmopolitanism, friendship)</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solidarity (philanthropy, altruism, humanity, morality)</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peace</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Love</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>1244</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most contents where universal values are recognised were detected in analysed geography and history textbooks. However, it is necessary to point out that that does not mean that textbooks of these subjects affirm, that is, promote universal human values.

As we can see from the following table, values are more often listed only declaratively, which implies that the affirmation of universal human values was not taken as an initial position and the goal of the textbook authors.

### TABLE 7 THE REPRESENTATION OF UNIVERSAL VALUES ACCORDING TO SUBJECTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>The number of lessons where universal values are merely MENTIONED</th>
<th>The number of lessons where universal values are PROMOTED</th>
<th>The number of lessons where there are NO universal values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>160/602 (27 %)</td>
<td>60/602 (10 %)</td>
<td>382/602 (63 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>221/665 (33 %)</td>
<td>18/665 (3 %)</td>
<td>426/665 (64 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language and literature (B/C/S)</td>
<td>157/1055 (15 %)</td>
<td>89/1055 (8 %)</td>
<td>809/1055 (77 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religious education (Islamic, Catholic, Orthodox)</td>
<td>10/346 (3 %)</td>
<td>18/346 (5 %)</td>
<td>318/346 (92 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>548/2668 (20 %)</td>
<td>185/2668 (7 %)</td>
<td>1935/2668 (73 %)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The examples which follow illustrate the contents where values such as equality, life and liberty are only mentioned.
It is noted how, for example, people should respect each other, how everyone should have equal rights and how differences represent the richness of humankind. However, it is not stated, nor problematized how to ensure equality. The possibility of discussion on what leads to inequality or why we should perceive difference as richness is also not offered.

**Ethnic tolerance should exist among nations.** That includes respecting one another and the opportunity of every nation in the world to express their culture, language, customs and religious affiliation freely... **People in the entire world should respect and accept one another** regardless of their sexual, racial, national and religious affiliation...

The duty and obligation of the rich, healthy and educated is to help the poor and the helpless... (Lesson: Population structures, G1)

The Declaration of the Rights of Man and of the Citizen established general human and civil rights for the first time in history – people are born free, they are equal before the law, and their private property is inalienable. (Lesson: The French Revolution, H22)

When we look around, we will recognise people with different names, appearances, interests. We will notice that we perceive the same thing in different ways depending on our experience, motivation, and the culture we come from. **These differences are the richness of humankind,** the wealth of the Ummah. (Lesson: What Makes Man - Man, RE12)

### 4.1.1 Contents in the function of affirming universal human values

Contents which **promote adopting and developing values** were recognised only in 185 lessons. Ten per cent of such contents came from geography lessons, eight from language and literature lessons, five from religious education lessons and three per cent from analysed history lessons.

The values **promoted** most frequently are **responsibility and life.** On the other hand, values which are promoted the least are peace and love.

In geography textbooks, the value **responsibility** is promoted most frequently in the context of personal and collective responsibility in protecting the environment. In lessons which deal with topics such as soil, plant and animal life and the endangered environment, aside from explaining basic concepts and terms, authors point to the causality of the natural processes and people’s role. Certain opinions which promote the responsibility of people towards their environment and surroundings are emphasised.

With their activities, people do not only influence the improvement of the quality of soil, but also on its reduction through various forms of pollution (chemical, physical, biological, etc.). Most often, land is polluted with pesticides, detergents, communal and industrial wastewater drainage as well as physical waste. Cutting forests, building roads, opening quarries and other activities of people increase erosion and influence the reduction of productive/useful surfaces. We can conclude that the protection and the rational use of land represent conditions for the development of life on Earth, especially the development of agricultural production and the improvement of the
quality of people’s lives. The growing needs for agricultural and unpolluted soil due to the growing needs for the production of “healthy food” require us to pursue active measures of pollution protection and the protection of agriculture soil from the uncontrolled construction of various facilities (towns, factories, roads, etc.). Such an approach stems from the fact that there is no technological procedure or factory which can produce the land which we need more and more. (Lesson: Soil, Plant and Animal Life BH, G15)

In religious education textbooks, responsibility as a value is most often promoted in the context of taking over responsibility for one’s own choices and the consequences of human actions.

You are facing choices which influence your life every day. Do not forget that choices include responsibility for the consequences, which could be good or bad. Strive to cause good consequences with your choices. (Lesson: Persevere When It Is Difficult – Allah’s Wisdom Is Endless, RE10)

In history textbooks, the value which is promoted most is equality, and most often in the context of promoting gender equality, equal economic and social opportunities, while liberty is most promoted in language and literature textbooks (in the context of creation, creativity, beauty, knowledge), as well as life.

The nineteenth century was still not favourable to women. Centuries of prejudice were stronger than logic, which clearly showed that women were intellectually equal to men, and that there was no reason they should have fewer political and other rights. However, even then women, who were aware that it was an injustice, existed. One of them was Mary Wollstonecraft, an English writer and women’s rights fighter. Near the end of the 18th century, when human rights were spoken of, she spoke of women’s rights: “Women are told from their infancy, and taught by the example of their mothers, that a little knowledge of human weakness, justly termed cunning, softness of temper, outward obedience, and a scrupulous attention to a puerile kind of propriety, will obtain for them the protection of man; and should they be beautiful, everything else is needless. (…) I earnestly wish to point out (to women) in what true dignity and human happiness consists.” Comment on the stated opinions. Compare them to the position of women today. (Lesson: Society, Culture and Change in Everyday Life in the First Half of the 19th Century, H21)

In the following table the frequencies of all values promoted are listed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Value</th>
<th>Frequency of examples of values promoted</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility (responsibility to oneself, others, the environment, cultural and historical heritage, work)</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life (well-being, optimism, humour, happiness)</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality (equality, fairness, righteousness, honesty)</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Value</td>
<td>Frequency of examples of values promoted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Liberty</strong> (security, creativity/art/beauty, knowledge/science/education, truth)</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Solidarity</strong> (humanity, altruism, philanthropy, morality)</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cooperation</strong> (pluralism, togetherness, coexistence, tolerance, cosmopolitanism, friendship)</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peace</strong></td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Love</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>318</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TABLE 8 THE FREQUENCY OF EXAMPLES OF VALUES PROMOTED**

The following examples include the contents which promote and contextualise values such as equality, life, cooperation and solidarity, where contents are connected with the present and everyday life, thus offering a possibility of discussion.

However, prosperity was until recently intended for the minority white population. The white population completely excluded the non-white population (black people and mixed races) from every political, economic and cultural life of the country with its racist policy of apartheid. The consequences of such a policy lead to an unequal social and economic development of the population of various racial characteristics. The population of the South African Republic was divided on a racial basis for a long time – that was the apartheid policy... You must have heard about apartheid and Nelson Mandela. Try to explain what apartheid is and what Nelson Mandela has to do with abolishing such a hideous racist division. (Lesson: The South African Republic, G5)

Photography – the Jewish had to wear a sewn yellow star on their clothes so they could be recognised at all times. What do you think, how do these people feel while walking down the street? How would you feel if you had to wear such a sign or a similar one? (Lesson: Fascism in Italy and Nazism in Germany, H9)

Each one of us is extremely important. Everyone contributes to a more secure and comfortable coexistence. Weakness of one influences the well-being of the entire community in a bad way. Therefore, everyone is invited to contribute to the construction of a better life with his or her own abilities, talents and effort. That is especially achieved by developing quality relations with the world and the things which surround it, with other people, with ourselves, with God... In life, we meet different communities. We are also a community. What do we expect of our community and what are we willing to do to make everyone in it feel accepted? It is important that we can count on one another, especially when we need help and when others expect help from us... DID YOU KNOW? Sadly, we often dismiss those who are different from us, especially the deaf, the blind, the poor, etc. However, do you know: Bach was blind during the final years of his life; Beethoven was deaf, but he still composed because he...
could imagine the sound of the final notes; Mozart started composing at the age of five, he went on tours across Europe and played for royal families, but he was always poor? He died so poor that only the gravedigger attended his funeral... LET'S THINK AND TALK... How can each of us contribute to a better life? ... What differences do you perceive among the people you live with? What do they have in common? (Lesson: I and Others Together, RE1)

4.1.2 Missed opportunities for the affirmation of universal values

According to researchers’ estimate, the topics processed from grade six to nine in geography, history, language and literature, and religious education, offer numerous opportunities for the promotion of universal values. However, those opportunities are not used in many lessons.

In geography lessons where the focus lies on natural disasters, such as earthquakes, floods, tsunamis, or where nuclear disasters are mentioned, textbook authors fail to promote responsibility, cooperation, togetherness, solidarity. The data are merely listed, the information is provided in the form of statements or interesting notes, but they do not go further than that; no discussion is encouraged, and the role and task of society and the individual is not questioned.

The reconstruction of political history of the epoch in question dominates history textbooks, while other spheres of human actions in the past are often neglected. Topics which deal with economy, culture, education, the position of women, children, lower layers of society, are processed sporadically in most textbooks. In lessons which deal with the topics of conquest and conquest policies, the chance to explain and point out why achieving and maintaining peace is important is often not used. The negative consequences of wars are stated (destruction, the number of casualties, the destruction of property and cultural heritage); however, no opinion on war as a way of solving conflict is presented.

The two alliances were enemies in many ways, and the conflicted interests could not be solved politically. It was obvious that a war was bound to break out. However, the issue of the cause of war remained. (Lesson: The Beginning of World War One, H22)

Of course, the territorial spread could not have been achieved without wars. (Lesson: The Development of the United States of America and the Results of the Civil War, HP6)

Universal human values, although often recognisable in literature (story, paragraph, poem) processed in Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian language and literature textbooks are, however, rarely promoted, since they are not connected with in the current context through questions, or they are simply not in the focus of the lesson.

There is a string of examples where the analysis deals with characters only, where the interpretation is often reduced to the formal level, where attention is drawn only to the language and form, without questioning the actions of the characters, and where content is neglected. The pupils are not asked to
provide a contemporary context for the meaning or to express their own relation to it, which means the opportunity to discuss the values included in the literary works is missed.

Furthermore, topics such as tradition, patriarchy, violence, repression, inequality and injustice are rarely problematized and contextualized. They are approached in a superficial manner, which reduces the lessons to mere reproduction and facts memorisation without the opportunity of discussion. Attention is diverted from the important to the unimportant, stereotypical representations are encouraged and a chance to promote universal values such as equality and liberty is missed.

Violence is generally ignored, questions about the causes and the consequences are not asked. Furthermore, questions about the attitudes towards women and about the patriarchal/epic culture are not posed, thus the issue of violence against women is left neglected, as a part of a humorous image of the patriarchal family.

In religious textbooks, you can find numerous examples of contents supporting the development and adoption of values such as life, responsibility, cooperation, solidarity and equality. However, such contents are most often placed in the context of religion which is being studied and they are tied to dogmatic teaching and beliefs of a certain religious community. Therefore, those values are not presented as universal. Instead, they are presented as religious and they are reduced to the particularity of a single group, that is, a single religion.

Also, even though authors of textbooks for the Islamic, Catholic and Orthodox religious education do not neglect other monotheistic religions, the way other religions are represented mostly comes down to formally listing certain aspects of teachings in other religions and mentioning other religious communities in order to note differences in teachings and practices. That means that the opportunity to promote universal human values such as cooperation, liberty, equality is missed.

The Christian ideal of freedom: Freedom is the dream of every individual and the aspiration of every society. The notion and ideal of freedom is one of the great fruits of
Great philosophers claim that “whole parts of the world, Africa and the Orient”, as well as ancient Greeks and Romans did not know the idea of true freedom. The idea and ideal of freedom appeared in the world thanks to Christianity. Before Christianity, man was not thought to be free. It was believed that nature, mysterious forces, fate, etc. rule the world. Christianity brings a whole new image of the world and man. Fate is replaced by God who gives man freedom. Man is invited to live freely and responsibly in the freedom granted to him by God. (Lesson: Freedom Comes from True Love, RE2)

4.1.3 Content in the function of indoctrination

The operating definition of the notion of indoctrination comes from the essay Concepts of Indoctrination (Concepts of Indoctrination: Philosophical Essays, Edited by I. A. Snook, Routledge, London and Boston, 2010 (1972)) as a negative form of education which combines method, content and intent, so it leads people/pupils to believe and accept (intent) a certain doctrine or ideology (content) by disrupting their rational thinking (method).

In this particular analysis of textbooks of the national group of subjects, indoctrination refers to the endeavour of education authorities (authors of curricula and textbooks, and, in some way, legislative bodies) to present the values of each particular constituent (Serbian, Croatian, Bosniak) nationalism as desirable and the only one right. Researchers detected indoctrination with regard to nationalism by relying on the results of the previous research, What Do We Teach Children, as well as the results of the doctoral dissertation of Nenad Veličković (Ideological Instrumentalization of Literature in Bosnian-Herzegovinian Textbooks of Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian Language and Literature on the Examples of Readers from Grade Five of Primary School to Grade Four of Secondary School).

As methods of disrupting rational thinking, the analysis recognised: pointing out one’s own (national) narratives and values; access to content from a single (national) perspective; bias in representing cultural, gender, religious and other differences; subjectivity in matters of responsibility for crimes etc. Piety, tradition and past were the most frequent content for the application of these methods.

4.1.3.1 Stressing a single people, culture, tradition, language, religion

The importance of preserving values based on the particularities of the national, historical, cultural and religious tradition of the nations which live in BH (especially constituent nations) is clearly emphasised in laws which regulate upbringing and education in primary schools in Bosnia and Herzegovina, as well as curricula.

However, content analysis of textbooks which were included in the analysis showed that the material, especially the one which deals with national geography and national history, as well as language in literature, is presented in textbooks by politicizing and ideologizing contents and by supporting the narratives which encourage inequality, separatism, hostility and which perceive difference as a problem.
Contents which emphasise only one people (one of the three constituent peoples) and/or culture, tradition, language, religion of that people was noted in all textbooks. Others are mentioned in passing, or they are not mentioned at all, which implies that pupils do not need to know more about them and that all pupils the authors address are the members of that constituent people. In turn, that implies that classes, like schools, are homogenous communities in the matters of nationality, language and religion.

Therefore, for example, we find examples in geography textbooks for the curriculum in Croatian where everything which is connected with Croats and Croatian is emphasised, while in textbooks for the curriculum in Serbian, everything related to Serbs and Serbian is emphasised.

Blidinje lake is located between mountains Vran and Čvrnica. The highest peak of Čvrnica is Pločno (2228 m). That is the highest peak on Croatian territories. (Lesson: Bosnia and Herzegovina Geography, G27)

First, the Spaniards settled, but other nations followed soon, especially the Italians, Germans, etc. A significant number of displaced Croats live in Argentina... Punta Arenas is located in the south. Also called “the southernmost city in the world,” an economic centre and a starting port “on the doorstep of Antarctica.” It is also one of the centres of our expatriates in Chile. (Lesson: Argentina and Chile – The Southernmost States of the American Continent, G20/G22)

The territory of Bosnia and Herzegovina has been exposed to numerous and different population shifts for centuries. The migrations of the Serbian population were common in the past, during Turkish conquests of Bosnia and Herzegovina. (Lesson: Socio-Geographic Characteristics of Bosnia and Herzegovina, G15)

Throughout history, the Serbian nation has had friendly ties with the Greeks, based on history, culture and the orthodox religion. The Holy Mountain with 20 monasteries, including the great Serbian monastery Hilandar is located on the Athos peninsula. Cemeteries of Serbian soldiers who died in World War One are located in Salonica (Zeitenlik) and the islands Corfu and Vido (“the blue tomb”). (Lesson: The Republic of Greece – The Land of Islands and Peninsulas – Regions and Their Significance, G11)

Geography textbooks speak very rarely or almost never about other nations which do not belong to the constituent nations, which speaks of neglect and ignorance of minority groups. The following example illustrates that quite well; the Roma are not mentioned at all, even though they are the largest national minority in BH.

The three constituent nations: Bosniaks (43.5%), Serbs (31.2%) and Croats (17.4%) make up the majority of the population. Aside from members of these nations, members of various national minorities live in Bosnia and Herzegovina (Montenegrins, Macedonians, Albanians, Italians, Hungarians, etc.). (Lesson: Countries of the Balkan Peninsula, G3)
In history textbooks from grade seven to grade nine, there is often only a single national perspective present, and only one constituent nation is in focus.

For instance, in the history textbook for the curriculum in Bosnian, in lessons which deal with the national history of Bosnia and Herzegovina during war and post-war periods, more attention is paid to Bosniaks.

At the same time as the crimes of Ustashas over the Serbian people started, the crimes of Chetniks over Bosniaks and Croats started as well. They were led by the colonel of the defeated Yugoslav army Draža Mihajlović. Their goal was to rebuild Yugoslavia and create a “homogenous Serbia,” that is, an ethnically clean state. While pursuing that goal, Chetniks carried out several massacres of Bosniaks in eastern Bosnia, especially in Foča, Goražde, Vlasenica and its surroundings, as well as Srebrenica. The crimes over Bosniaks were done in Koraj near Brčko, then in the cities of Bosanska Krajina, eastern Herzegovina and parts of Sandžak. (Lesson: Bosnia and Herzegovina in World War Two, H9)

In textbooks for the curriculum in Croatian, where the history of Europe is described from the Middle Ages to the Modern Ages, authors focus mostly on Croatia. The Croatian historical narrative dominates, while the history of Bosnia and Herzegovina is represented much less. Contents represent the reconstruction of the political history from the perspective of the Croatian state and nation and the Croatian national interest. The significance of the Croatian nation is pointed out and there is a strong underlying feeling of patriotism. The territory of today’s Croatia and the Bosnian territory are represented as a cultural and geographical whole. The rest of the neighbouring nations and states, aside from Bosnia, are only mentioned in passing and no particular attention is paid to them. In lessons which deal with the topics of war and suffering, the suffering of the Croatian people is emphasised and Croats and all things Croatian are presented as endangered.

The territory of Bosnia was inhabited in prehistory. The material remains of the prehistoric cultures show that there was a single culture and geographic whole on the Bosnian territory and the territory of today’s Croatia. The main roads from Pannonia and Podunavlje went through the valleys of Bosnian rivers to the Adriatic Sea. Croats arrived on those same roads to their new homeland, and, on their road to Dalmatia, one part of them stopped in Bosnia and settled there. The start of the medieval Bosnian history is tightly connected with the Croatian Kingdom in that way. Since the beginning of the 12th century, Bosnia started its own independent development, but it was ruled by rulers of Croatian descent. (Lesson: Medieval Bosna and Herzegovina, H18)

... The FPRY is defined as a federal people’s republic with a clearly centralised government. The centralist government utterly destroyed almost any statehood of the

---

11 The Federal People’s Republic of Yugoslavia
republics. The Croats were poorly represented in state administration. At the highest levels of state authority and the CP\textsuperscript{12}, the principle of national equality was honoured. However, at lower levels, that ration was disrupted in many cases, mostly benefiting Serbs... The emigration of Croats from their homeland, which had started towards the end of the 19th century, continued well into the 60s and the 70s, so their number abroad was almost equal to the one in their homeland. However, those who remained in Croatia and made it into one of the most developed republics in Yugoslavia, had to allocate significant funds to the federal government. At the expense of their own development. Croatia had to financially help the economic development of the underdeveloped parts of Yugoslavia with allocations from its own economy. (Lesson: From ZAVNOH\textsuperscript{13} to the Croatian Parliament, H24)

Instead of a foreword, the History textbook for grade 8 of primary school (H24)

The similar applies to the history textbooks for grades seven, eight and nine that are used in schools which follow the curriculum in the Serbian language, where also a single national and historical discourse dominates and the role of only one – Serbian – people is emphasised. Ignorance, reduction, mystifying and imputation are often used when presenting content.

\textit{Serbia was becoming a leading Christian state on the Balkans. It made plans to gather all of the South Slavs for the liberation of the rule of others. (Lesson: Great Powers and the Balkans, H12)}

\textsuperscript{12} The Communist Party

\textsuperscript{13} The State Anti-fascist Council for the National Liberation of Croatia
In partisan units, Serbs were the majority of fighters, which means that the Serbian people gave the largest contribution to the victory over fascism. (Lesson: The War in Yugoslavia 1944–1945, H13)

The Constitution from 1974 greatly damaged Serbia. The provinces of Vojvodina and Kosovo were separated and they became states within the state... Separatists and independence fighters operated in both provinces. The Serbian people was in a very difficult situation in Kosovo. The Shqiptar separatists and nationalists publicly asked for the republic of Kosovo and its annexation to Albania... (Lesson: Violent Secession and the Dissolution of Socialist Yugoslavia, H13)

After the assassination, the persecution of Serbs and the destruction of their property began. On the same day, the hotel “Europe,” whose owner was a Serb, Gligorije Jeftanočić, was destroyed. That was followed by the arrest of prominent Serbian traders, writers (including Ivo Andrić) and politicians. (Lesson: Serbs in BH and World War One, H13)

Contents which point out a single (constituent) people and language, the culture and tradition of that people dominate textbooks for Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian language and literature. Others are ignored and they are not learned about. No matter how much they contribute to the construction of national identity and love for one’s homeland (most often, the one considered “the motherland” – what Serbia is to Bosnian Serbs, and Croatia to Bosnian Croats), such contents do not support learning about others, respecting the liberty of others, intercultural understanding, equality, responsibility.

For instance, in readers for the Bosnian language, only examples from Bosnian oral literature are listed, but the existence of other oral traditions is neglected, and the history of literature is spoken about within a single, Bosnian, tradition.

Even today, Sevdalinka still remains the most beautiful form of folk song which is sung and preserved in its most beautiful original form. (Lesson: Sevdalinka, LL1)

In older Bosniak literature (i.e. literature prior to the 19th century), a special place belongs to literary work in Oriental languages (Turkish, Arabic, Persian), and especially to the so-called divan poetry – a particular occurrence in poetry, grounded on the sufistic, Islamic-mystical perception of the world and life... (Lesson: Lyric Poem, LL5)

Or, to provide an example of readers for the Croatian language, where it is taken for granted that all consumers (buyers of the reader) are Christian and that they celebrate Christian/Catholic holidays. That implies that the authors suppose that there are no people of other religions, atheists, agnostics. However, this approach leaves all others, the “non-Catholics,” on the outside of the teaching process, since they cannot answer the tasks set before them.
What holds the beauty and the greatness of Christmas. During the holy Christmas days, baby Jesus enters everyone's home... Describe your experience of Christmas. Pay special attention to the mood in your family and Christmas customs in your homeland. (Lesson: The Light in the House, Ante Matić, LL20)

Describe how you celebrate Easter in your home. What customs do the people from your homeland maintain? (Lesson: The Bible, LL20)

It is also evident that only a single, Serbian, people and their language are pointed out in textbooks for Serbian language and literature. It is also evident that the content and authors which come from the Serbian tradition and literature dominate those textbooks. That is illustrated by the examples of biographies of writers whose work is being studied. The biographies of Serbian authors are given significantly more space, and sometimes they are used with the purpose of glorifying/mystifying the author, while the biographies of other authors are succinct and often do not even include a picture of the writer.

The examples of contents which speak of the language and literature tradition of other, non-constituent peoples that live in Bosnia and Herzegovina, such as the Roma or the Jews, are rare and, sadly, often include simplified and reduced representations. They either satisfy the criterion of political correctness, or even encourage stereotypes. However, they very rarely encourage understanding of others, cooperation, solidarity, equality and the affirmation of pluralism as a quality.

By doing this, authors are turning language and literature textbooks into collections of texts that will teach pupils the national ideology and formal qualities of texts rather than the rich and varied meanings of literature.

4.1.3.2 The representation of a single perspective

In analysed textbooks, certain occurrences, events and personalities are often represented through a single (ethnocentric/Eurocentric) perspective, while using simplified representations, reduction, relativization, ignorance, imputation and mystifying such content. That means that the whole is not perceived, that the conclusion is made on the basis of the adequately selected content, that the pupils’ attention is diverted from what is relevant to what is irrelevant, that discussion is avoided, vague opinions presented, that the other and the different remains purposely unseen, that stereotypes are encouraged, that occurrences and events are (intentionally) interpreted incorrectly or incompletely, and that subjectivity is turned into objectivity by using rhetoric, phrases, ambiguities, metaphors. Not only is critical thinking thus made impossible, but the affirmation and the development of values like liberty, equality, and responsibility as well. In geography textbooks, issues and topics such as colonisation, armed conflict, division of goods and natural resources, poverty, education and population migration are rarely problematized and contextualized. The approach is superficial and the lessons are reduced to pure fact memorisation without the opportunity of a discussion. That does not clarify anything, nor does it encourage discussion on the deleterious effects of the racial segregation policy, denying liberties and equality. The injustice and violence, as well as the unequal position of the native/indigenous population...
of Middle and South America or Australia are not even mentioned. Poverty as a state and occurrence is
simply mentioned, and wars and armed conflicts are listed as characteristics of certain geographic areas,
while fatalities and other consequences of war are mentioned only in passing.

The area of the Near East and the Middle East are areas with unstable political
occurrences and numerous wars. Oil deposits are not only a blessing of these
countries; they are often the cause of numerous conflicts. We bear witness to war,
numerous car-bombs, terrorist attacks and the assassinations in Iraq. Similar conflicts
are happening in Afghanistan, Palestine and Israel. Due to the Arab-Israeli War, even
the Suez Canal was shut down from 1967 to 1975. (Lesson: The Mediterranean, G2)

In lessons in which focus is on other continents, especially those about Africa, the population of African
countries, their economy etc., there are contents which include discriminatory stances, which encourage
stereotypes, thus indirectly promoting the supremacy of the “white, modern man” in relation to all
others. The citizens of African countries are often depicted in photographs in a context which alludes to
misery, poverty and underdevelopment.

We have also noted examples where opinions, political beliefs and ideologies are instilled in pupils
through the use of a specific rhetoric, thus precluding different understanding and interpretation of the
content from the one offered by the author.
On the **unique territory of the Croatian homeland** there are now two states – Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Republic of Croatia. (Lesson: Position, Size and Borders of the Republic of Croatia, G27)

In the civilised world, several religions which occupy a relatively small space (aside from Switzerland) is not really a common occurrence, but nowhere is it considered a problem. On the contrary, religious and ethnic diversity is the richness of cultures and customs. Sadly, that is not the conclusion to be drawn from the example of the history of Bosnia and Herzegovina... The Constitution of Bosnia and Herzegovina establishes two entities (state communities): the Federation of Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Republic of Srpska. Therefore, there are three constituent and equal peoples living in two entities. It is not hard to deduce who has come up short in Bosnia and Herzegovina... Even without that, Bosnia and Herzegovina is a dysfunctional state community. (Lesson: The National and Religious Composition of the Population, G27)

The Croats are trying to preserve their cultural and overall identity through the Croatian language and education from kindergarten to university. You must love films and sports events and watch them on TV. *Which TV programme do you like most? You would be glad if Croats got their own programme on national television, wouldn’t you?* (Lesson: The National and Religious Composition of the Population, G27)

Macedonia has a complex (heterogeneous) national structure. The majority of the population consists of Macedonians, 70%, followed by the members of other nations – Albanians (22%), Turks, the Roma, Serbs, Vlachs... The share of the Serbian population is constantly decreasing. In the western part of the state, Albanians have become the majority. The birth rate of Macedonians keeps decreasing, while the Albanian is growing. That is why the number of the Albanian population has increased significantly... List the main problems of Macedonia when it comes to the ethnic composition of the population. (Lesson: FYR Macedonia, the Republic of Albania – Basic Physical and Geographic and Socio-Geographic Characteristics, G11)

It is also noticeable that in history textbooks, authors present simplified contents, offering a single perspective while using reduction, relativisation and insinuation. Conclusions are drawn on a small and appropriate sample, the whole is not perceived, nor are all aspects of a certain event or occurrence questioned. That leads to incomplete understanding, uncritical thinking and the lack of affirmation of universal values.

In content presentation, textbook authors place the interest of the state and nation, not individual, at the forefront, which is why liberty is spoken of in the context of liberation and the freedom of (one, specific) collective, and not the individual.
Another perspective and personal responsibility are often neglected. Therefore, others are usually to blame for violence, war, denial of rights, and no personal responsibility of the individual or nation whose perspective is taken is mentioned. One whole nation is characterised as the enemy and the criminal, but when (and if) crimes committed on behalf of one’s own nation are mentioned, those are acts of individuals.

In the first multi-party election, which was held in 1990, the national parties one and took power. SDA and HDZ joined forces in breaking up Yugoslavia. Bosniak and Croatian MPs in the Assembly of Bosnia and Herzegovina formed a coalition and made decisions without the consent of the Serbian representatives... Muslim (Bosniak) and Croatian leadership carried out a referendum at the beginning of 1992 without the consent or the participation of the Serbian people. The relative majority of Croatian and Muslim voters voted for the secession of Bosnia and Herzegovina from Yugoslavia into an independent state. On April 12th 1992, it was internationally recognised, surprising the Serbian people, and thus, war began. (Lesson: War in Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Creation of the Republic of Srpska, H13)

The aforementioned dishonourable acts were committed mostly out of vengeance or greed, through actions of individuals or criminal groups, and they stand in opposition with the honourable behaviour of the vast majority of Croatian commanders, soldiers and police officers in the Croatian War of Independence. They were not part of Croatian policy, nor were they planned with the intention of banishing Serbs from Croatia, unlike killing and banishing Croats and other non-Serbian population, destroying towns and cultural and religious monuments, which is something the Serbian forces carried out in Croatia from 1991 as part of the planned policy of ethnic cleansing, with the goal of creating a unique Serbian state on a large part of territories of former Yugoslavia. This cannot be neglected if we want to represent the course of history in Croatia from 1990 to 1995 in a comprehensive and objective way. Especially the circumstances in which the crimes were committed cannot be neglected. That is why there are more victims on the Croatian side than on the Serbian side in the Independence War. That is, precisely because the Serbian forces mostly planned this, they committed an incomparably larger number of crimes than their opponents, so the number of murdered Croatian civilians was higher than the number of Serbian casualties. In any case, the final liberation operation Storm was carried out with minimal casualties (military and civilian), when compared to the victims various armies in similar final operations had caused on that territory... (Lesson: The Consequences of the Independence War, H24)
4.1.3.3 Diversity as a problem

In analysed textbooks, especially geography and religious education textbooks, examples of contents which treat pluralism and difference as a problem, and not a quality, were identified.

It is evident that textbook authors have a tendency of pointing out differences more frequently than the similarities of the population in lessons which deal with multiethnic and multicultural societies. The diverse structure of the population is often referred to as “complex,” which implies that it is something complicated and incomprehensible. Ethnic, religious and language diversity is presented as the main culprit for the existing intolerance, as the cause of conflict, as an obstacle for the solution of the problem. Such simplified and reduced representations do not promote diversity, pluralism, coexistence; rather, they lead to strengthening stereotypes and making wrong conclusions – war is an inevitable occurrence in the territories where people who belong to different ethnic groups, religious communities or who speak different languages, live.

The ethnic composition of the population is extremely complex. There are over 250 ethnic groups living there. There are great language, cultural and religious differences among them, which is why conflicts often happen. (Lesson: Basic Information on Nigeria, Congo and Ethiopia, G6)

One of the most important characteristics of the Asian population is the existence of many nations. The sense of national affiliation is very strong, and it is manifested in the joint language, religion, ancestor cult or something else. Until today, animosity has been maintained between certain neighbouring nations. That is the cause of constant conflicts between the Jews and Arabs, Hindus and Muslims, Armenians and Azerbaijani. (Lesson: Asian Population, G24)

Northern Ireland is a politically unstable region for national and religious reasons. The Irish Catholic population wants to secede and become a part of the Republic of Ireland, which is why conflicts occasionally occur. (Lesson: United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland – Elementary Natural, Economic and Social Characteristics, G11)

Even though religious education textbooks promote equality of all people and communities in principle, examples of contents that present (religious) diversity as a problem were also identified. Textbook authors do not create any distance from the content, they do not leave room for discussion, another perspective, critical questioning.

Such an approach to contents finally leads to misunderstanding and developing a negative attitude towards the people who live differently, belong to other religions or do not believe at all. So the teachings of the Jehovah’s Witnesses, Adventists and Pentacostalists are represented succinctly, indirectly. They are equated with Satanism, which is also spoken of in the context of so-called sects, which encourages intolerance. New religious movements are also simplified in their representation. It is suggested that the founders of such movements get rich easily or that all teachings of the “new religious movements” advocate mass suicide of its members.
Those new believers conquer with the strength of their conviction and the simplicity of their teaching. But they are equally the causes for concern, because it is evident that they have material, and not spiritual goals at heart when they cause rifts in families, or when they decide to carry out collective suicide. (Lesson: Looking for God in New Religious Movements, RE5)

Sectarians differ from one another, but they do have something in common. They all strive to destroy the basic elements of human existence, such as FAMILY and STATE... All sects are equally dangerous for the soul of every Christian. Their founders are mostly people with some emotional and psychical problems. Because of their disorders, they imagine that God has chosen precisely them to spread His word. ... Precisely the goal of all sectarians is to rip the young people from the embrace of the Church of Christ and to win them over for their heretic teachings. (Lesson: The relation of Christians with Sects, People of Another Faith and Infidels, RE9)

Analysed contents state that nations which do not believe in a single god are primitive and pagan, while atheism is completely equal with sin and connected to ideologies such as fascism, Nazism and communism, which encourages hostility towards atheists.

What are the greatest challenges for the Church today? The dechristianisation of many Christian countries increased in the 20th century. Atheism is taking hold. The twentieth century is a century of great and deadly political ideologies (fascism, Nazism and communism). It is also the century of two world wars in which millions of people died. In some countries, the Church was openly attacked and Christians were persecuted. That was a period of great trials for the Church. (Lesson: New Face of the Church in the 20th Century, RE2)

Atheism stems from religious indifference. It can follow one from their earliest age or it can weasel its way into their heart bit by bit... We have already said that every man is, of course, religious, that his soul is directed towards God... To be born and raised in a religious desert means believing that there is no God...

If atheism is the negation of God, in practice, there can be many ways of being an atheist. As a way of life, atheism is introduced through new ideologies and worldviews, which exclusively glorify man and his power... Science and technology can enhance the strength of practical atheism, especially if man is so engrossed in his knowledge and technological progress that he forgets all ethical and moral principles. He does not need God anymore, so he starts acting as an atheist... Humanism without God takes care of the earthly, but not the eternal needs of man. When such people come to power, they wish to organise society without faith and its influence, especially on the upbringing of the young. (Lesson: Atheism and Religious Indifference, RE5)
4.1.3.4 The victimisation and glorification of martyrdom

The prevalence of a single perspective is reflected in contents where the suffering of the members of a single, one’s own, nation, is emphasised, while the suffering of others is mentioned in passing, or, even, ignored. By emphasising the number of victims or pointing out the role of the victim, victimisation is reproduced, certain acts and events such as initiating conflict and participating in wars are justified and legitimised, and stereotypes of one nation as the eternal victim of the hegemony of another nation/other nations is encouraged.

In the following example, we can see how the textbook authors use the words of the literary character without any questions raised; they suggest that the words are true, which deludes the pupils, who are not given the possibility to discuss these claims; words are taken out of context, the theoretical analysis of the character is skipped. The authors use the words of the literary character to confirm the constructed myths about the Bosniaks (even though Bosniaks are never explicitly mentioned in the said quote), and not to question the stated claims of the literary character in class.
With his gentle serenity, honesty and acquired knowledge, Hasan entered the menagerie with the steady step of the ignorant. But seeing as he is not stupid, he soon saw what coals he tread on. He could either accept all, or remain unnoticed, or leave. He, unusual as ever, while refusing the cruelty of Istanbul, started thinking more and more of his town and compare its quiet life to this tumultuous one. They mocked him, spoke of that secluded, backward wilayah with contempt.

Meša Selimović, Death and the Dervish

Discussion corner

What was Hasan like?
What was he proud of?
What did he defend?
How did he describe the Bosniaks?
Has something changed in the fate of the Bosniaks? Explain!
Why did Bosniaks become noble?
How do you perceive your homeland?

Despite the proclaimed uniqueness of all Yugoslavs, in reality, the Serbian domination was still present until then. That was reflected in the use of the national name and national symbols. The regime suppressed the Croatian name and national symbols, and their public use was punished strictly. At the same time, the Serbian name and national symbols were used freely under the excuse that those were religious symbols. The Serbian Orthodox Church still retained its national designation, while its flag and symbols were the same as Serbian national symbols. (Lesson: The Croatian People Resisting the Sixth January Dictatorship, H24)

Today’s national structure in BH is different because war influenced the change of this structure, so the number of Croats reduced by half. The Croats were once the autochthonous people in BH, but they had to leave the territory due to many reasons (economic, political, the drop in the birth rate etc.), which resulted in the reduction of
the national group of Croats in BH. The share of Serbs also reduced, while the number of Bosniaks increased. (Lesson: The Structure of the Population of Bosnia and Herzegovina, G25)

When the Croatian people hoped that, after the fall of the communist rule, they could live in peace, freedom and democracy, it was hit by the bloody and imposed war. The Church was the target of the great Serbian aggression, as well as the people. Numerous believers were banished from their homes and parishes, many churches and religious buildings were destroyed. At the height of the greatest war suffering, Catholic bishops called for peace and tolerance, defending the right of the Croatian people to legal defence. (Lesson: The Catholic Church in Croatia Today, RE5)

(“Flash” and “Storm”) Croatian armed forces killed thousands of Serbian women, children and old men during the attack. Hundreds of thousands of Serbs were banished from their hearths. The Croatian planes and artillery targeted refugees who were fleeing to Serbia. NATO did not condemn these violent operations; rather, it supported them and assisted them militarily... There was no understanding in the international community for the Serbian people that only wanted freedom, and national and human rights. (Lesson: Violent Secession and the Dissolution of Socialist Yugoslavia, H13)

Some of the common stereotypes are also not problematized, such as sacrificing the people for their freedom, the greatness of the tragedy of only one nation, epic codes, etc. That glorifies the suffering in the name of the nation, but personal liberties, responsibility (personal and collective), solidarity and peace are neglected. Finally, the stance that the homeland must be loved and defended is imputed.

IF YOU WANT MORE

If you want to say something more about your homeland, read this poem, too. After reading it, you will surely wish to write something nice and state your vision of the country you live in. Think, what is it that you can offer it?

Bosnia

They will die for you
Your people
Even if you’re all under nails
Just that you never
Experience pain
My dreamlike tear.

Enes Kišević (Lesson: Mak Dizdar, A Word on Earth, LL4)

The homeland is the country we were born in, the state we live in and the people we belong to by birth. We need to love our homeland, to preserve it, to hold great love for it... God himself placed the love for one’s birthplace, his people and the homeland and
people he comes from in man’s heart. The love for one’s homeland asks Christians for the following: a) to perform the duties of their calling conscientiously; b) to help the progress and the well-being of their people and homeland in every way, according to their own abilities and possibilities c) to strive to renounce all evil which would threaten their homeland d) to share the joy and sadness, the good and the bad luck of their homeland and their people with all their heart, and, if necessary, to sacrifice their own life for it according to the words of Lord Jesus Christ: “Greater love has no one than this, that someone lay down his life for his friends.” (John 15:13) ... A Christian is obligated to respect all governing authorities and their orders and carry out all their commandments, for there is no authority except that which God has established. (Rom 13:1) (Lesson: Duties towards One’s Homeland; The Importance and Obligation of State Laws, RE9)

4.1.3.5 War as inevitability

In history textbooks, especially in lessons which deal with the topics of conquests and conquest policies, war is presented as a necessity, as an inevitable occurrence, a means of spreading state territories, accomplishing political goals and as the basic part of life. If it is a defensive war and if it leads to freedom, the defence of one’s territory and people, the war is legitimate, and the death of those who “died as heroes” is justified, which glorifies war and the army.

The Croatian War of Independence (1991-1995) was a legitimate and defensive war for liberation, because the Republic of Croatia was under attack and was forced to defend its sovereignty and independence, as well as its territorial integrity. That is why the military operations and the operations of Croatian forces in the Independence War served as defense for the purpose of liberation. Thanks to the bravery and the skill of Croatian defenders and the unity of the political leadership and most of its citizens, Croatia won the war. (Lesson: Consequences of the Independence War, H24)
Wars become the basic part of life

Human communities are connected on a wider basis. More interconnected lineages make a sept, and septs create tribes. For the purpose of protecting certain property or area, military groups are formed. Therefore, since that time, war has become the constant part of the human society. That is how patriarchy is developed.

Even though authors state the negative consequences of wars, such as destruction, the number of casualties, the destruction of property and cultural heritage, what is lacking is the strong opinion on war as a way of solving conflict.

4.1.3.6 The sacralization of the nation – the nationalization of religion

The contents which propagate the sameness of religious and national identity are most present in religious education textbooks (even though similar contents can already be found in textbooks for other subjects included in the analysis). Religious, ethnic and national is equated – one could not be formed or survive without the other; being a good citizen means being a good believer and “we” are better than “them.”

Common religion represents a basis for building a nation. For example, the common Christian religion contributed to the formation of the Serbian nation, while the Serbian Orthodox Church is the bearer of the unity of the Serbian people; Islam is pointed out as an important part of Bosniak identity, while the
syntagm the Croatian Church often places Catholicism within the framework of Croatianhood and nationalizes the Church.

As we mentioned in the previous part, the Serbian Church became the only true leader and bearer of unity of the Serbian people after the Battle of Kosovo. It helped the enslaved people not to become despondent because the Turkish conquests were followed by the suffering of the population, the destruction of religious buildings, and there were instances where churches were turned into mosques... (Lesson: The Serbian Church after the Battle of Kosovo as the Bearer of the Unity of the Serbian People, RE7)

BOSANSKO SUSRETANJE S ISLAMOM

Mi nismo muslimani od islama Mehmeda Osvijetelja, ni smo muslimani negdje, no jest odamos! Na našim vrhovnim stanju prije 1463. godine, u Bosni bili krvaviti i muslimani! Upravo tako... Veliko vi, ni nismo primiti islam od Mehmeda II Osvijetelja, ali smo islama nade obješodaniš! Bio nam je po prijatelj i, a onda se pokazao i na lično.

Prebačio u našoj zamišljenjel je kave svjetskih veličanstvenih, u kojem pluta gde gde visok, u kojem je u svijetu noviji, i nada pozašta, kamenj. I sada u sebi goje od uobičajenog oblikovanja stvar, da izbije korijen, da u prošlosti gde danad nije bilo.

Enes Karić, Pjesme divljih ptica

BOSNIAN ENCOUNTER WITH ISLAM

We have not been Muslims since Mehmed the Conqueror, we have been Muslims since before, that is, since a long time ago! For all those eight centuries prior to 1463, we were Christians, but Muslims here in Bosnia. Precisely... I am telling you, we did not receive Islam from Mehmed II the Conqueror, we only brought Islam to light then! It had been in our hearts before, and then it was shown on our face! The past in our country is like a vine of squash, it does not bear fruit where it grows; rather, it carries it in torment, and births it farther down, later. And it moves it away from itself, crawling through winding roads, to hide the root, to spread where it hasn’t been yet.

(Enes Karić, Songs of wild birds)

Discussion on the excerpt

What does this excerpt from the novel Songs of Wild Birds speak of?
What does it mean that they were “Christians, but Muslims”?
Where was islam in BiH present before Mehmed the Conqueror?
Since when is islam officially present in BiH?
How did it spread?

IMAGE 5 AN EXAMPLE OF CONTENT WHICH PROPAGATES THE SAMENESS OF RELIGIOUS AND NATIONAL IDENTITY – EXCERPT FROM THE LESSON BOSNIAN ENCOUNTER WITH ISLAM (RE13)
Bosniak national identity is based on the Islamic cultural heritage, European ethnic origin, a sense of belonging to our homeland, Bosnia and Herzegovina and our language distinctiveness. **Our identity is characterised by three designations: our citizenship is Bosnian, our national affiliation is Bosniak, and our religion is Muslim.** The motherland of Bosniaks is Bosnia and Herzegovina. However, a great part of our people lives outside of the state borders, in the diaspora... Bosniaks are the majority in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Unlike some other peoples, whose countries were named after themselves, Bosniaks were named after their homeland... A recognisable comparative distinctiveness of Bosniaks in relation to other European nations is the fact that they belong to the Islamic worldview. The development of the spiritual and material culture, as signs of Bosniak identity, was, and still is, strongly influenced by Islam... At the same time, Bosniak identity is greatly connected to the Bosnian language. The Bosnian language has a completely natural and independent course of development and, most importantly, it has its heirs. **There is no nation without language, therefore the protection of the distinctiveness of language is, in fact, the fight for the right to exist within one’s own culture – the right to a life chosen by oneself.** We should know that people do not choose their ethnic origin; rather, they become the part of the community in which they were born with the act of birth. Therefore, on the ethnic plane, **we are Bosniaks because our parents are Bosniaks.** But, in order to stay a part of our ethnic community in spirit, we need to adopt, cherish and persevere its cultural values. (Lesson: Islam and the Identity of Bosniaks, RE13)

Christianity has left indelible traces in the history of many European nations. Since arriving on these territories in the 7th century, **the Croatian people has been inextricably connected with the Catholic Church.** The Church has followed it carefully throughout the fourteen centuries of its history. It was close when they created their own state, when they were under foreign rule, when they lived in a state of great reputation and when they tried to save their existence with final efforts. **By sharing the historical fate of the Croatian people, the Church grew with it and became a part of its being.** (Lesson: The Catholic Church and Christianity in Croatia, RE5)

Language represents an important designation of national and religious identity, so authors of religious education and language and literature textbooks did not want to avoid introducing language into the context of the nation, which benefits the limited understanding of language as a means of national identification, and not as a means of communication.

**The official language of the Serbian Orthodox Church is Serbian with the Cyrillic script (Art 4, Sec 1). Only in extremely justified cases can this stipulation be waived and only if there is special approval from the Holy Synod.** The **Cyrillic script is extremely important for the preservation of Serbian identity and true Serbs will always write in Cyrillic in their private lives; they can write in Latin only in extremely justified cases.** Of course, every literate man should know both scripts, but should only use his own script, like members of other nations do, paying no heed whether Serbs can or cannot read it. (Lesson: The Organisation of the Serbian Orthodox Church, RE7)
These chosen and presented contents are part of national narratives which are based on separatism, endangerment and hostility. They certainly do not contribute to the affirmation of pluralism and values such as equality, cooperation and freedom.

4.2 CRITICAL THINKING

The criterion Encouraging the Development of Critical Thinking refers to those contents in textbooks which encourage the development of critical thinking and the application of what has been learnt.

Critical thinking includes a string of intellectual abilities, such as the ability of analysing notions, information and perspectives, the ability to differentiate between relevant and irrelevant information within the set context, the ability to interpret information, the ability to connect previous knowledge and new information, as well as different information from different areas, the ability to view the topic of discussion from different perspectives, the ability to form stances and advocate ideas, the ability to take an active role in the learning process, metacognitive abilities... By developing and using critical thinking, intellectual values such as relevance, precision, consistence, logic and objectivity are also developed. (Buchberger 2012).

Reproductive thinking stands in opposition to critical thinking. That is the process and the result of simply adopting and understanding information, which includes repeating the thoughts of others, thus avoiding the reflection of the individual.

Critical thinking indicators (CTI) were defined within this research. They include active learning, problem solving, the multiple perspective approach and differentiated representations. Reproductive thinking indicators (RTI), which include the inability to discuss, basic fact memorisation, the single perspective approach and stereotypical representations, stand in opposition.

Nowhere in the curricula from grade six to grade nine has it explicitly been pointed out that the development of critical thinking is one of the goals when teaching geography, history, language and literature and religious education. However, in defined tasks and learning outcomes, it is written that pupils should learn to spot, analyse, compare, connect, differentiate, estimate, represent critically, evaluate, deduce, provide arguments aside from memorising, understanding and applying information. That includes higher levels of knowledge adoption and the development of skills such as analysis, synthesis and evaluation, which characterise critical and creative thinking.

Each of the 2,668 analysed lessons in 68 textbooks was estimated in relation to the defined indicators. Grade 1 signified critical thinking indicators, grade 2 signified reproductive thinking indicators, and 0 was used for contents where none of the listed indicators was noted.

The results show that active learning is encouraged in 38% (N=1020) of the total number of analysed lessons, problem solving in 20% of lessons (N=527), the multiple perspective approach is present in 6% of lessons (N=148), while differentiated representations are present in 5% of lessons (N=121).
On the other hand, in 46% of lessons (N=1229), no opportunity of a discussion is offered, in 64% of lessons (N=1705), the contents mostly come down to mere memorisation of facts, in 34% of lessons (N=907), the single perspective approach is predominant and in 13% of lessons (N=335), stereotypical representations were noted (Graph 2).

The researchers gave 67 lessons (2.5%) the grade 0 according to all indicators, which means that not a single indicator was recognised in the contents of those lessons; that is, neither critical, nor reproductive thinking indicators were recognised. The function and purpose of those lessons in textbooks is mostly interpretative, which means that lessons represent a source of data, and contents mean the representation and systematisation of information on a certain topic. Therefore, the function of lessons is not to point to methods and activities of learning and to motivate pupils to learn, only to offer information.

In 115 lessons (4%), all indicators of reproductive thinking were recognised, which means that no discussion possibility is offered in those lessons, the content is reduced to listing and mere fact memorisation, it is presented from a single perspective, and stereotypical representations are used.

All critical thinking indicators were recognised in only 12 lessons (0.4%), which means that those lessons support active learning, encourage problem solving, the multiple perspective approach is present and differentiated representations when presenting content were used.

The overview of results in relation to subjects (Table 9) shows that active learning and problem solving are mostly encouraged in geography lessons (in more than 40% of analysed lessons), that the multiple perspective approach is mostly recognised in religious education lessons (but only in 16% of analysed lessons) and that differentiated representations are most present in history lessons (in mere 14% of lessons).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Critical thinking indicators</th>
<th>Geography (number of lessons)</th>
<th>History (number of lessons)</th>
<th>Language and literature (number of lessons)</th>
<th>Religious education (number of lessons)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Active learning</td>
<td>398/602 (66.11 %)</td>
<td>174/665 (26.16 %)</td>
<td>328/1055 (31.09 %)</td>
<td>120/346 (34.68 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem solving</td>
<td>297/602 (49.33 %)</td>
<td>17/665 (2.55 %)</td>
<td>147/1055 (13.93 %)</td>
<td>66/346 (19.08 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple perspective approach</td>
<td>12/602 (1.99 %)</td>
<td>35/665 (5.26 %)</td>
<td>44/1055 (4.17 %)</td>
<td>57/346 (16.47 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Differentiated representations</td>
<td>1/602 (0.17 %)</td>
<td>95/665 (14.29 %)</td>
<td>8/1055 (0.76 %)</td>
<td>17/346 (4.91 %)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 9 THE NUMBER OF LESSONS WHERE CRITICAL THINKING INDICATORS WERE RECOGNISED – OVERVIEW BY SUBJECTS

4.2.1 Contents which encourage the development of critical thinking

Contents in analysed textbooks which were identified as enabling the active participation of pupils in the learning process were recognised in 38% of analysed lessons, while contents which help pupils use strategies of problem learning and develop the ability of higher-order thinking (such as observation, comparison, classification, setting hypotheses, criticising, collecting and ordering information, looking for assumptions, summarizing, interpreting, problem solving) were recognised in 20% of analysed lessons.

These contents mostly refer to questions and tasks placed at the beginning and/or the end of the lesson, which encourages the pupils to express their own opinion, to discuss, to work in pairs or in a group, to analyse and draw conclusions based on the offered information and additional content (such as maps, illustrations, historical sources), to compare information or to think about the causes and consequences of a certain condition or occurrence, to research something independently, to connect the content of the lesson with previous content from that subject or from the content from other subjects, and to connect what they are learning with everyday life and personal experience.

We find the examples of such contents, in geography textbooks, for instance, in the tasks which ask pupils to use a map or statistical data to make comparisons, analyses and state their own conclusions and explanations; to calculate something, to measure or determine some unknown value based on other offered values or to solve problem situations by doing experiments.
In history textbooks, for example, those include questions and tasks which ask the pupils to compare today’s way of life (starting from the social order and rights, to lifestyles) to some social characteristics from the past and to make conclusions about the significance of certain events for the further course of history on their own.

In language and literature textbooks, those include examples of questions in the analysis and interpretation part of literary work which encourage the pupils to think about the actions and behaviours of others from several perspectives. In religious education textbooks, however, those include questions which encourage pupils to think about themselves, their qualities, actions, the decisions they make and their relation to others.

The multiple perspective approach is, sadly, neglected in most textbooks and lessons (it was recognised in only 6% of analysed lessons), seeing as authors rarely offer several sources when presenting content, and it is even more rare that they offer several perspectives which view the problem differently.

Questions and tasks in analysed textbooks are most often not designed to ask pupils to compare or analyse different and/or opposing opinions or sources of information on a certain topic, occurrence and event in order to draw their own conclusions based on that or evaluate the credibility and relevance of other sources of information.

If the multiple perspective approach is noted, it usually refers to the contents which contain different perspectives or theories in describing certain occurrences or events; or tasks in which pupils are encouraged to look for and research additional sources of information on their own (most often, these include offered web-links to pages where pupils can find more information on the topic discussed).

Contents which encourage differentiation and offer pupils the opportunity of developing an open and flexible stance towards others and their own group, lead them to reconsidering rooted stereotypes, discovering social notions and contents which encourage social engagement and the development of sensitivity to social inequality, were noted in only 5% of analysed lessons.

Most examples of such content we find in history textbooks, where social relations and the position of people in different social organisations, communities and epochs are described and where the topic deals with gender inequality and the position and rights of women.

European settlers founded their cities and maintained the lifestyle similar to that in Europe, which was completely different and separate from that of the natives. The native population was forced to work in the mines and do other hard labour. The population which did not work in the mines produced food for miners or brought additional workforce. Exhaustion, hunger and diseases lead to their mass casualties. That is why black African slaves were increasingly used, due to the lack of workforce.

(Lesson: Great Geographical Discoveries, H12)

Look at the layout of the rooms in the house. What conclusions can you draw on the position of women? They had special rooms and they were not allowed to attend
parties organised by men. They led the household, oversaw the slaves, and they knew how to weave and sew. Fathers of young girls arranged the marriages. They were married very young. (Lesson: The Life and Culture of Ancient Greeks, H3)

Equality with men and the right to vote still remained the causes of their protests. Women’s disenfranchisement was visible in sports competitions. At the Olympics, which were held until World War One, mostly men competed. However, women continued their public and business work. For some of them, the consequences of war were irreversible. While men went to war, women performed their jobs successfully. However, many families lost their male members, so their burden fell on the women. (Lesson: The Great World Economic Crisis (1929–1933), H24)

4.2.2 Contents which encourage reproductive thinking

Even though the general results of the analysis show that contents which encourage the development of critical thinking are present in textbooks, most lessons in textbooks are still designed to affirm reproductive thinking. In almost 60% of analysed lessons in language and literature and religious education, the opportunity for discussion is not offered; in more than 70% of analysed lessons in history, language and literature and religious science, content is reduced to mere fact memorisation (Table 10). The single perspective approach dominates in language and literature lessons (45%) and religious education (53%), while most stereotypical representations were recognised in the analysed religious education lessons (23%).
Such contents in textbooks are mostly characterised by simple (often unilateral) description, while no discussion on the problem topics is encouraged. Contents barely encourage pupils to discuss, and express their own opinion. They are not guided to set hypotheses, explore and test possible solutions. Learning through discovery is not stressed; rather, learning is treated as a passive process of memorising facts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reproductive thinking indicators</th>
<th>Geography (number of lessons)</th>
<th>History (number of lessons)</th>
<th>Language and literature (number of lessons)</th>
<th>Religious education (number of lessons)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No opportunity for discussion offered</td>
<td>110/602 (18.27 %)</td>
<td>258/665 (38.80 %)</td>
<td>663/1055 (62.84 %)</td>
<td>198/346 (57.23 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mere fact memorisation</td>
<td>139/602 (23.09 %)</td>
<td>508/665 (76.39 %)</td>
<td>787/1055 (74.60 %)</td>
<td>271/346 (78.32 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Single perspective approach</td>
<td>117/602 (19.44 %)</td>
<td>134/665 (20.15 %)</td>
<td>473/1055 (44.83 %)</td>
<td>183/346 (52.89 %)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stereotypical representations</td>
<td>84/602 (13.95 %)</td>
<td>45/665 (6.77 %)</td>
<td>125/1055 (11.85 %)</td>
<td>81/346 (23.41 %)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 10 THE NUMBER OF LESSONS WHERE REPRODUCTIVE THINKING INDICATORS WERE RECOGNISED – OVERVIEW BY SUBJECT

Contents which do not offer the option of discussion and which come down to mere fact memorisation are often abundant in definitions, theoretical explanations and data which are, mostly, presented in the form of facts and lists insufficiently supported by concrete examples which would facilitate understanding and enable meaningful learning.

Such contents usually insist on recognising, naming and repeating what was learnt (information, ideas, concepts), rather than insisting on discussion, independent reasoning or creative thinking. The option of analysis, synthesis, evaluation and independent conclusion-making is reduced to a minimum. Formally asked questions only ask the pupils to repeat what is written in the lesson, and not to think critically, connect, analyse and compare.

In 34% of the total number of analysed lessons, only one perspective is used when presenting content. That means that authors stress a single perspective (often Eurocentric and nationally and politically coloured) when describing and explaining certain occurrences, events and persons. Or, they point out a single characteristic while excluding or ignoring others. Other and different sources of information are rarely offered in such contents, which is also the case with different insights. That does not encourage the development of openness towards others or one’s own group.
So, for instance, the single approach perspective in history textbooks is particularly noticeable in lessons which deal with the Middle Age and national and recent history, while reduction, ignorance, imputation and mystifying are often used. Authors often use outdated information and represent the past unilaterally, which precludes the chance of developing constructive criticism and pointing to the existence of different stances and opinions among scientists and sources on a certain issue. Finally, that points to the fact that such content is in the textbook in order to propagate national/nationalist narratives, and not to be used in critical analysis and viewing different perspectives.

Another example is the language and literature textbook where, for instance, only oral literature, literary tradition or cultural heritage of one of the constituent people in BiH is pointed out while others are completely neglected.

Or examples of contents in religious education textbooks where it is listed that only one thing is acceptable and right – that *which our religion teaches us*, where authors sometimes assume the position of authority whose words are not questioned. In doing so, they do not guide the pupils towards other sources of information and knowledge.

Some of the examples illustrating this are presented in the following.

*People are given their gender and racial marks by birth, and, above all, they determine their physical appearance. Depending on the environment in which they are born and live, they will belong to a certain nation, learn the language and accept the religion of that nation. Depending on their position in the society, they will acquire a certain level of education etc.* (Lesson: Population Structures, G1)

*Today’s territory of BH is part of the territory which was inhabited by the Croatian population in the Middle Ages. Up until the Turks arrived, political, language and religious unity thrived there.* (Lesson: Natural Geographic Wholes of Bosnia and Herzegovina – Northern Bosnia, G25)

*...Bosnia has always strived to secure its own political and cultural distinctiveness... We can see how every source listed testify on the particular nature of the Bosnian state, whose mountains helped its preservation and defence against unwanted guests from the outside.* (Lesson: The First Data on Medieval Bosnia. H4)

*There was no understanding from the international community for the Serbian people who only wanted their freedom, their national and human rights.* (Lesson: Violent Secession and the Dissolution of the Socialist Yugoslavia, H13)

*Stunned, the predominantly Croatian Catholic population was banished, Islamised and disenfranchised. That way, a single Bosnia finally disappeared, and, three Bosnias gradually appeared, which are noticeable in modern ethnic image of the lands of Herzegovina and Bosnia – today’s state of Bosnia and Herzegovina.* (Lesson: Bosnia and Herzegovina – My, Your and His Homeland – Our State of Bosnia and Herzegovina, G27)
The defeat of Albanian terrorists enabled the strengthening of sovereignty of the FRY in its entire territory. However, that did not suit the interest of NATO members. NATO members, especially the USA, planned to militarily and politically subdue the Balkan states in order to reach the East unimpeded and to gain power over vast sources of oil, gas, coal and other materials. (Lesson: The Formation of the Federal Republic of Yugoslavia, H13)

Medjugorje is unavoidable, so we will focus on it for a bit. That is the spiritual centre of the entire world and Herzegovina. Since June 24th, 1981 (the first apparition of Our Lady on the hill), Medjugorje has become a place of peace. A place of prayer, reconciliation with God and people. Millions of believers from around the world flock to the inexhaustible river of love. The Croats have had a special bond with Our Lady throughout history.

Also, the authors do not include topics or list different stances and opinions which would problematize the accommodating opinions stated in lessons. So, for instance, in most geography lessons, there is no opportunity for a discussion on racism, exhausting natural resources and poverty; most history lessons do not offer the option of discussing causes of armed conflicts and wars, as well as reconciliation; language and literature lessons do not include the option of discussing patriarchy, violence, addiction, sexism; religious education lessons avoid discussing topics such as atheism, divorce, contraception and homosexuality.

A man without faith is like a ship without a compass. (Lesson: Christian Virtues: Faith, Hope and Love, RE9)

ON THE PURENESS OF HEART: Not believing in God, or atheism, stems from the impurity of heart.

ON PACIFISM: Without peace with God and with ourselves, there is no peace in the human society. (Lesson: On Mercy, the Pureness of Heart and Pacifism, RE9)

The exalted Allah created Adam and Eve so that they made a couple of two sexes, a man and a woman, which attract each other. And that is the basic law of Allah in all bipolar matters where opposite sexes attract, and the same repel one another. (Lesson: Everything Was Made in Pairs, RE13)

It is God’s idea that the two beings of different sex should attract and complement each other in responsible love. That means that heterosexuality is the basic mark of human beings. (Lesson: Friendship and Love, RE5)

Stereotypical representations, where general explanations of behaviour and/or qualities of entire groups, nations and geographic spaces based on limited and very simplified descriptions are made, were recognised in 13% of the total number of analysed lessons. The identified examples of contents which support stereotypes mostly refer to ethnicity, origin, religiousness, patriotism, gender, motherhood.
Based on these contents, pupils should learn that the Roma are nomads who peddle, collect waste and play music, that Serbs and Montenegrins like to wage wards, that religious and ethnic affiliation is the same thing (all Bosniaks in BiH are Muslims, Croats Catholic and Serbs Orthodox), that all immigrants in Europe are Muslims, that nations who have a traditional way of life and who cultivate the land, hunt and fish are primitive, that the Near East is characterised by conflict, oil, Islam and terrorism, that Africa is poor and primitive, that Bosnia and Herzegovina and the Balkans are synonyms for underdevelopment, stagnation, instability, conflict, that nation as a construct has existed forever, that atheists are immoral, without a clear goal and meaning in life, doomed to fail, that girls are pretty, kind and noble, and that women are mothers, first and foremost; that modern times are full of challenges, diseases, where no values are fostered, the tradition is not respected, where people are lonely and miserable...

The Roma are a nomadic people originally from India. They live across the world, but mostly in Europe (countries of East and South Europe). They have their own language and culture. They are characterised by specific occupations: peddling, collecting and selling scrap materials, music. (Lesson: Socio-Geographic Characteristics of Europe – Population, Natural Shifts and Migrations, G11)

There are three important characteristics of Southeast Asia – dry climate, oil and Islam. (Lesson: Southeast Asia, G24)

Iran and Afghanistan are organised as Islamic republics. This is an area of constant conflict. (Lesson: Political and Geographic Division of Southeast Asia, G2)

The awareness of national affiliation has always existed. (Lesson: Croatian People’s Rebirth and the Appearance of Modern Nations in Europe, H21)

Why do I have to have a mom who is a Croatian language professor? Wouldn’t it be better if she were sitting now, watching some TV show or playing games? (Lesson: Present Tense, LLg18)

Therefore, every child should wish well to their parents, gratefully acknowledge all the good they have done for them and serve as joy and comfort to their parents with their behaviour and honesty. (Lesson: Christianity and Community – Marriage, Duties of Children and Parents towards One Another, RE9)

That is why a mother should be wise and pious, because man will carry for the rest of his life that which she instils into the child’s soul in childhood. (Lesson: Christianity and Community – Marriage, Duties of Children and Parents towards One Another, RE9)
In these ten years since the first content analysis of textbooks, a reform of primary education was carried out. The reform strived to change the education paradigm thoroughly. The new concept of nine-year education (instead of the standard eight-year education) stressed the results of learning and competences needed for personal fulfilment and development of the individual, active citizenship, social involvement and employment. The curricular approach in planning and programming with the intention of integrating knowledge, skills, stances and values was introduced for the first time. Among other things, the comprehensive democratization and humanization of the education system was stipulated. That was supposed to prepare young people to become conscious and responsible citizens in the pluralistic society of Bosnia and Herzegovina. Schools were meant to encourage creativity, problem solving, the application of knowledge and self-education. By choosing this new orientation, education authorities in Bosnia and Herzegovina opted for a “society of knowledge, humanity and values,” recognised the significance of education in the European integration process, and committed themselves to adopting world economic and civilisation tradition. This was followed by an extensive process of creating new curricula and textbooks for all grades of the new, nine-year primary school, and enormous human, financial and institutional resources were engaged.

The research *Education in BH: What Do We (Not) Teach Children* was done with the intention of evaluating the results of the primary education reform through content analysis of textbooks, because education policies, methodology and practice are explicitly manifested and summarised in textbooks. A total of 2,688 lessons in 68 textbooks of the national group of subjects were included in the analysis.

The results of the research unequivocally showed that the planned change did not occur and that the concept of textbooks remained same as the one from 2007. Despite declarative advocacy, the drafting of strategic documents and legislation, no essential change in the concept and approach to education was materialised in new textbooks created within the reform of the nine-year primary education during the last ten years. They do not affirm the values of democratic society, active citizenship and social involvement, nor do they sufficiently instigate the development of critical thinking, creativity and active learning.

These findings confirm the conclusions of earlier analyses of the new curricula which established that the reform resulted in exclusively structural changes in the form of the introduction of the ninth grade and the formal division of primary education into three cycles. Essentially, schools still follow the traditional programme with the highly prescriptive contents divided into separate subjects and the dominantly frontal method of work.

What is more, it was determined and demonstrated that the dominant system of values in textbooks of the national group of subjects in all three curricula stands in opposition to the proclaimed goals of the reform and that it fundamentally relies on the **sociocentric and conservative way of thinking**.
Sociocentrism is based on the belief that the perspective of one’s own group is the only one and the best. Therefore, the dominant national perspective is presented in textbooks, since the primacy is on the collective rather than on the individual, the fear of the other and self-victimisation is “fostered,” wars are glorified and violence justified. The state (homeland) is seen as the territory owned by the ethnic collective which survives thanks to defence, sacrifice and the spilt blood, while history is seen as a string of events in which the collective played the main role with the aim to prove its longevity, survival and sovereignty. Conclusions are made based on a small and appropriate sample, the whole is not perceived, nor are all aspects of a certain event or occurrence questioned. That leads to incomplete understanding, uncritical thinking and the lack of affirmation of universal values. Sociocentric thinking serves as the basis for the development of stereotypes and prejudice, it precludes questioning, developing objective social perceptions and an open and flexible stance towards others and one’s own group.

The situation in Bosnia and Herzegovina is interpreted from an ethnocentric point of view where the primacy rests on one’s own ethnic group. However, global occurrences are perceived from a Eurocentric perspective where Europe is “the cultural, industrial and civilisation centre of the world,” and topics such as colonisation, the division of goods and natural resources, poverty and population migrations are rarely problematized and contextualised.

The new textbooks for the nine-year primary school also express distancing from the ideas and ideals of Enlightenment and Humanism; rather, they give priority to traditional relations which include obedience and maintaining the existing state through respecting, accepting and maintaining customs and ideas of the traditional culture and/or religion to which the individual/collective belongs. Religiousness is reduced to a “single religion,” and that religion is represented as the exclusivity of a single collective and its important determining factor. Respecting tradition (where customs are uncritically represented as value) and authority, refraining from actions, intents and proclivities which could disturb social expectations and norms, and, in that regard, obedience as a desirable virtue are encouraged.

The conservative worldview which places emphasis on duties and the respect of hierarchy rather than the freedom of choice and personal responsibility prevails in textbooks. The acceptance of traditional and stereotypical gender roles is suggested and topics such as patriarchy, violence or repression are not questioned. There is no opportunity for discussing atheism, non-marital partnership, divorce, euthanasia, abortion, contraception, homosexuality etc. Equally, the affirmation of accepting others as equals and being concerned for their well-being, as well as the openness to changes which mean freedom of thought and action are lacking. On the contrary, contents of textbooks support and justify conformism, the uncritical acceptance of the opinion of the majority, without questioning facts and stances. Consequently, (ostensible) security and inviolability are maintained instead of the creative and qualitative change for the better.

The findings regarding contents which develop critical thinking are in accordance with such a “system of values.” The development of critical thinking in pupils is encouraged only declaratively; textbooks offer no information from different sources, they do not problematize understanding of the perspectives from which the information is given, they do not encourage active thinking on the advantages and
disadvantages of that information and do not offer knowledge necessary to make an informed
deduction/conclusion.

In the contents which the textbooks offer, there is rarely space for learning at higher levels of cognition;
the pupils are rarely left to construct their own understanding of what is learnt and apply the acquired
knowledge and skills. Questions and tasks rarely instigate thinking, the contents suitable for
independent learning are lacking, the teaching methods are not adjusted to the age and needs of pupils,
they are not encouraged to discuss, express their own opinion, provide arguments and estimate the
opinion of others. This is in line with favouring sociocentric opinion which suppresses the development
of objective social perceptions and an open and flexible attitude towards others and one’s own group.
For the same reason, the multiple perspective approach of the material and topics is not present.
Peaceful, open and substantiated solutions to conflicts with the equal participation
of all included
desire other’s group.

As a result of the analysis of textbooks of the national group of subjects, we can rightfully
 conclude that the reform (from the eight-year primary education to the nine-year primary education)
did not advance social cohesion, establish a higher respect of human rights and basic liberties, and it did
not introduce integrated learning and teaching, which was stated in the reform documents.
RECOMMENDATIONS

A radical and comprehensive change of the concept of textbooks within the wider process of the total reform of education is needed so that textbooks could encourage critical thinking and the affirmation of universal values and have a developing and formative role in the entire development and education of a child, not only declaratively, but truly. Such a process should include:

a. redefining textbooks

In contemporary conditions, a printed book cannot be the main and basic source of knowledge, that is, the most important teaching aid. Sources of knowledge can and should be various media content (including the print media). One joint legislative solution needs to be offered on this matter (starting with the definition of textbooks), and then adequate bylaws should define the roles, responsibility and obligations of all participants in the education process.

b. creating the standard of textbook quality

It is necessary for a quality textbook (which applies to other sources of knowledge) to completely contribute to the achievement of education goals by satisfying the clearly defined requests and standards. If we perceive a textbook as a source of certain texts (including non-verbal information) whose aim is to enable the adoption of a certain knowledge, ability, skill and value, then those texts – lessons, units of content – should fulfil the following standards:

- It must be clear for each unit in the textbook what its education goal/outcome is. Furthermore, goals and outcomes must be clearly defined by the adequate curriculum. Curricula in faculties need to be harmonised with the change of school curricula, which is the jurisdiction of faculty councils.

- The so-called hidden curriculum needs to be eliminated from teaching. The sociocentric narrative cannot have access to a textbook, except as the object of critical consideration. That is why it is necessary to develop methods of discovering and neutralising the hidden curriculum, which falls, above all, under the jurisdiction of the expert community, faculties, as well as adequate teams of teachers, through scientific (magister and doctoral) papers and specialisations.

- A textbook should critically dispute socially unacceptable worldviews (e.g. racism), but, at the same time, it should not impose or favour one acceptable worldview as opposed to others. The textbook can and should have a corrective function in relation to the teacher, since the teacher gives precedence to one (his or her own) worldview (it does not matter whether the teacher does this consciously or unconsciously).
• Textbook contents cannot advocate or tolerate discrimination on any basis. Conservative and stereotypical stances can appear in textbooks only within a multiple perspective approach to the topic, so that they could be critically reconsidered.

• Each unit in the textbook must be clearly connected with the value meant to be developed. Values which are developed must be contextualized within the environment in which the textbook is used and adapted to the age and abilities of the child. The textbook cannot deal with facts separated from values. Even in natural sciences, where this seems irrelevant, it is possible to connect knowledge with truth, progress, solving problems related to the quality of human life, the issue of starvation, ecology, health...

• The textbook cannot hide from pupils other relevant perspectives, contemporary scientific findings and the information necessary for the complete understanding of a certain problem. The curriculum needs to suggest correlation fields between several subject areas.

• Patriotism should not refer to (that is, it should not be reduced to) ethnic or territorial affiliation. Rather, it should refer to the idea of a citizens’ union within a state organisation which is included in the community of the states of the world.

• With its content, the textbook should encourage the pupils to perform useful community work, in which the adopted values would be checked and developed.

• The textbook should encourage pupils to think, discuss, research, and learn independently by equipping them or supporting them with appropriate didactic materials.

• The textbook should pay attention to inclusion by meeting the different abilities and needs of pupils.

• The graphic appearance of the textbook should be used to achieve certain goals – it needs to be clear and transparent, interesting and intriguing.

Aside from all of this, the adequate departments of the Ministry of Education need to pass clear instructions for textbook authors and ensure transparent approval procedures.

c. redefining the position and role of teachers in creating, evaluating, selecting and using textbooks

It is important to emphasise here that teachers hold the biggest responsibility for achieving education goals and outcomes. Accordingly, they need to have the final say regarding the way textbooks are chosen and used. Current teachers need to be trained for that role through adequate specialisation, while future teachers need to be trained by including all of the above in faculty syllabi. During the course of their education, future teachers need to be trained to use redefined textbooks, to critically analyse, evaluate and improve them. The textbook as a teaching aid needs to be a topic to which faculties will dedicate attention in accordance with the results of this research, especially with contemporary scientific achievements in this area.
Teachers must be included in the necessary process of textbook evaluation within research projects which would strive to establish how much textbooks are used in reality and how; and what their share in achieving education goals is.

c. including the Agency for Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education (APOSO)

It is necessary to secure support and the active participation of the Agency for Preschool, Primary and Secondary Education when defining and passing education and textbook standards at the state level. In the conditions of a sharpened ethnic mistrust where education is used as an ideological tool, and reforms are being sabotaged by the education authorities, the role of an expert institution such as APOSO is extremely important. The contemporary successful solutions in the world and signed declarations (especially the one on children’s rights) are a sufficient legal and moral framework to eliminate obstructions. In this process, we should count on the support of international organisations such as the OSCE, UNICEF, OHR, Save the Children and others.
### 6 ANNEX

**List of analysed textbooks**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Textbook code</th>
<th>Curricula</th>
<th>Textbook title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Catholic religious education</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>RE3</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Zajedno u ljubavi 7</td>
<td>Josip Periš</td>
<td>KRŠČANSKA SADAŠNJOST ZAGREB – SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2009.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthodox religious education</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>RE7</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Pravoslavna vjeronauka 7 – Istorija Srpske pravoslavne crkve sa narodnom istorijom</td>
<td>Nedeljko Pajić</td>
<td>Katihetski odbor</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthodox religious education</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>RE8</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Pravoslavna vjeronauka 8 – Dogmatsko bogoslovije</td>
<td>Veljko Stojanović</td>
<td>Katihetski odbor</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orthodox religious education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>RE9</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Pravoslavna vjeronauka 9 – Pravoslavna etika</td>
<td>Slobodan Vrhovac</td>
<td>Katihetski odbor</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic religious</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>RE11</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Vjeronauka za sedmi razred osnovne</td>
<td>Šefko Sulejmanović,</td>
<td>El-Kalem</td>
<td>2012.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Textbook code</td>
<td>Curricula</td>
<td>Textbook title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>language škole</td>
<td>Safija Husić</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic religious education</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>RE12</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Vjeronauka za osmi razred osnovne škole</td>
<td>Emina Grabus, Muamer Neimarlija, Ahmedina Purkovic, Melisa Zukić</td>
<td>El-Kalem</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Islamic religious education</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>RE13</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Vjeronauka za deveti razred osnovne škole</td>
<td>Emina Grabus, Muamer Neimarlija, Ahmedina Purkovic, Melisa Zukić</td>
<td>El-Kalem</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>H1</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Historija 6</td>
<td>Izet Šabotić &amp; Mirza Čehajić</td>
<td>“Nam“ Tuzla</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>H3</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Historija 6</td>
<td>Aida Petkovic &amp; Marina Pocrnja</td>
<td>“Klett” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>H5</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Historija 7</td>
<td>Edis Dervišagić, Hadžija Hadžiabdić, Alen Mulić &amp; Vahidin Mehić</td>
<td>“Bosanska knjiga“ Sarajevo</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>H6</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Historija 8</td>
<td>Edis Dervišagić &amp; Hadžija Hadžiabdić</td>
<td>“Bosanska knjiga“ Sarajevo</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Textbook code</td>
<td>Curricula language</td>
<td>Textbook title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>H7</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Historija 8</td>
<td>Asmir Hasičić</td>
<td>“Sarajevo Publishing” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>H10</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Istorija 6</td>
<td>Njemčević, Milović</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE I NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>H11</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Istorija 7</td>
<td>Mihaljić</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE I NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>H12</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Istorija 8</td>
<td>Vujadinović, Kuprešanin, Nagradić</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE I NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>H13</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Istorija 9</td>
<td>Pejić, Tešić, Gavrić</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE I NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>H14</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Povijest 6</td>
<td>Cerovski, Lovrinović</td>
<td>ŠKOLSKA NAKLADA</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>H16</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Povijest 6</td>
<td>Bekavac, Bradvica, Rozić</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>H18</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Povijest 7</td>
<td>Birin, Rozić, Šarlija</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Textbook code</td>
<td>Curricula language</td>
<td>Textbook title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>H20</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Povijest 7</td>
<td>Brdal, Madunić, Lovrinović, Madžar</td>
<td>ŠKOLSKA NAKLADA</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>H21</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Tragom prošlosti 7</td>
<td>Erdelja, Stojaković, Lovrinović, Madžar</td>
<td>ŠKOLSKA NAKLADA</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>H22</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Povijest 7</td>
<td>Bekavac, Kijajić, Rozić</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>H24</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Povijest 8</td>
<td>Bekavac, Jareb, Rozić</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>LL1</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Čitanka 6</td>
<td>Zejčir Hasić</td>
<td>“Bosanska riječ” Tuzla</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>LL2</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Čitanka 6 Daleki vidici</td>
<td>Almira Hadžihrustić</td>
<td>“Klett” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>LL3</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Čitanka 6</td>
<td>Azra Verlašević &amp; Vesna Alić</td>
<td>“Nam” Tuzla</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>LL4</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Čitanka 7 Slovo mudrosti i ljubavi</td>
<td>Almira Hadžihrustić</td>
<td>“Sarajevo Publishing” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>LL5</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Čitanka 7</td>
<td>Azra Verlašević &amp; Vesna Alić</td>
<td>“Vrijeme” Zenica, “Nam” Tuzla</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>LL6</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Naš jezik 7</td>
<td>Azra Verlašević &amp; Vesna Alić</td>
<td>“Vrijeme” Zenica, “Nam” Tuzla</td>
<td>2010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Textbook code</td>
<td>Curricula</td>
<td>Textbook title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>LL7</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Bosanski jezik 8</td>
<td>Almira Hadžihristić</td>
<td>“Sarajevo Publishing” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bosnian language and literature</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>LL8</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Čitanka 8 Zlatni snovi djetinjstva</td>
<td>Almira Hadžihristić</td>
<td>“Sarajevo Publishing” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatian language and literature</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>LL18</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Moj hrvatski 7</td>
<td>Lekić, Pranjković</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatian language and literature</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>LL20</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Moja čitanka 7</td>
<td>Lekić, Nikolić</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Croatian language and literature</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>LL23</td>
<td>Croatian language</td>
<td>Moja čitanka 8</td>
<td>Lekić, Nikolić</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serbian language and literature</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>LL31</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Srpski jezik i kultura izražavanja VII</td>
<td>Miloš Kovačević, Branko Savić</td>
<td>Zavod za udžbenike i nastavna sredstva Istočno Sarajevo</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

71
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Textbook code</th>
<th>Curricula</th>
<th>Textbook title</th>
<th>Author(s)</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Serbian language and literature</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>LL40</td>
<td>Serbian language</td>
<td>Srpski jezik i kultura izražavanja IX</td>
<td>Miloš Kovačević, Branko Savić</td>
<td>Zavod za udžbenike i nastavna sredstva Istočno Sarajevo</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>G4</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Geografija 7</td>
<td>Greta Župančić</td>
<td>“Bosanska riječ” Sarajevo, “Dječija knjiga” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2010.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>G5</td>
<td>Bosnian language</td>
<td>Geografija 8</td>
<td>Haris Jahić</td>
<td>“Sarajevo Publishing” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Textbook code</td>
<td>Curricula language</td>
<td>Textbook title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>G7</td>
<td>Bosnian</td>
<td>Geografija 8</td>
<td>Greta Župančić</td>
<td>“Bosanska riječ” Sarajevo, “Dječija knjiga” Sarajevo</td>
<td>2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>G9</td>
<td>Serbian</td>
<td>Geografija 6</td>
<td>Samardžić, Banjak</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE i NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>G11</td>
<td>Serbian</td>
<td>Geografija 7</td>
<td>Mandić, Živković, Kukrić</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE i NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>G13</td>
<td>Serbian</td>
<td>Geografija 8</td>
<td>Kovačević, Krunić</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE i NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>G15</td>
<td>Serbian</td>
<td>Geografija 9</td>
<td>Crnogorac, Trbić, Jevtić</td>
<td>ZAVOD ZA UDŽBENIKE i NASTAVNA SREDSTVA, ISTOČNO SARAJEVO</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>G16</td>
<td>Croatian</td>
<td>Zemljopis 1</td>
<td>Dubravka Rozić</td>
<td>ZNANJE</td>
<td>2014.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>G20/G22</td>
<td>Croatian</td>
<td>Geografija 2/Geografija 3</td>
<td>Brazda, Crkvenčić, Jelić, Dumančić, Brazda, Crkvenčić, Jelić, Mihalj</td>
<td>ALFA</td>
<td>2014/ 11.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Grade</td>
<td>Textbook code</td>
<td>Curricula Language</td>
<td>Textbook title</td>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Publisher</td>
<td>Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>G24</td>
<td>Croatian Language</td>
<td>Moj zemljopis 7</td>
<td>Anita Filipčić, Mirko Markotić</td>
<td>ZNAM d.o.o.</td>
<td>2004.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Tables

Table 1 Critical and reproductive thinking indicators ................................................................. 23
Table 2 The number of analysed textbooks and lessons in relation to the subject and grade ........... 24
Table 3 The number of analysed textbooks in relation to the curriculum ........................................ 25
Table 4 The number of analysed textbooks in relation to the use of script ..................................... 26
Table 5 The representation of universal values in the total number of analysed lessons ................... 27
Table 6 The frequency of recognised values in analysed textbooks .................................................. 28
Table 7 The representation of universal values according to subjects ............................................. 28
Table 8 The frequency of examples of values promoted ................................................................. 31
Table 9 The number of lessons where critical thinking indicators were recognised – overview by subjects .................................................................................................................................................................... 54
Table 10 The number of lessons where reproductive thinking indicators were recognised – overview by subject ......................................................................................................................................................... 57

List of Images

IMAGE 1 INSTEAD OF A FOREWORD, THE HISTORY TEXTBOOK FOR GRADE 8 OF PRIMARY SCHOOL (H24) ........................................................................................................................................... 37
IMAGE 2 INHABITANTS OF THE KALAHARI DESERT IN SEARCH OF FOOD - EXAMPLES OF CONTENTS WHICH ENCOURAGE STEREOTYPES – LESSON THE SOUTH AFRICAN REPUBLIC (G22) ......................... 40
IMAGE 3 THE EXAMPLE OF THE CONTENT WHICH REPRODUCES VICTIMISATION – AN EXCERPT FROM THE LESSON ISLAM AND THE IDENTITY OF BOSNIANS (RE13) ................................................................. 46
IMAGE 4 PHOTOGRAPHY WARS BECOME THE BASIC PART OF LIFE, LESSON THE METAL AGES (H2) ......49
IMAGE 5 AN EXAMPLE OF CONTENT WHICH PROPAGATES THE SAMENESS OF RELIGIOUS AND NATIONAL IDENTITY – EXCERPT FROM THE LESSON BOSNIAN ENCOUNTER WITH ISLAM (RE13) ......................... 50
IMAGE 6 PHOTOGRAPHY MEMBERS OF THE SUFFRAGETTE MOVEMENT, LESSON GREAT WORLD ECONOMIC CRISIS 1923-1933 (H24) ........................................................................................................... 56
7 BIBLIOGRAPHY


The Assembly of the Posavina Canton. (2010). Law on Textbooks and Other Teaching Aids for Primary and Secondary Schools in the Posavina Canton. Narodne novine Županije Posavske, 01/10.

The Assembly of the West Herzegovina Canton. (2009). Law on Textbooks and Other Teaching Aids for Primary and Secondary Schools in the West Herzegovina Canton. Narodne novine Županije Zapadnohercegovačke, 01/09.


Veličković, N. (2010). Ideological Instrumentalization of Literature in Bosnian-Herzegovinian Textbooks of Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian Language and Literature on the Examples of Readers from Grade Five of Primary School to Grade Four of Secondary School (Doctoral dissertation). Sarajevo, University of Sarajevo, Faculty of Philosophy.